

Legislation Text

File #: 24-0353, Version: 1

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM

ACTION REQUESTED:

Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for 124 S Loomis Street - COA 24-0533

DEPARTMENT: Transportation, Engineering and Development

SUBMITTED BY: Brad Iwicki, Assistant Planner

BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:

Submitted for Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review.

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is an approximately 13,500 square foot parcel south of Van Buren Avenue on the east side of S Loomis Street, with a common street address of 124 S Loomis Street. The property is zoned R2 (Single-family and Low Density Multiple-Family Residence District) and is currently improved with a two-story Italianate style residence, constructed in 1870, and a detached garage adjacent to the Loomis Street alley. The principal structure is listed as “potentially significant” to the Local Historic District as a good example of Italianate style architecture and in “good” condition in the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey (“2008 Survey”). The residence is a “contributing” structure to the Federal Historic District.

Prior changes to the original structure include removal of the original front porch, 1/1 wood replacement windows (historic), enlarged entry surround (not historic), 1-story rear addition and porch, front stoop replaced (not historic), small shed addition to north elevation.

At the time of the 2008 Survey, significant features listed include the hipped roof with wide wood frieze and the triangular pediments atop the windows.

The home remains a great 1860’s example of the Italianate style with the “L” form building, low pitched hipped roof with wide overhanging eaves, wood siding, and windows with decorative pediments.

Prior COA Approvals

- None

DISCUSSION:

The applicants and property owners, David Ladd and Sondra Maze Ladd, seek a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to allow for a two-story addition to a secondary façade that is visible from the right-of-way, a new covered front porch, new entryway roof, and removal of the existing fireplace chimney and construction of new fireplace chimney on the south elevation of the principal structure.

The addition is set back approximately 33 feet 10 inches from the primary façade and approximately 60 feet from the front property line. While this is an addition to the side of the residence, it can be seen from the Loomis Street right-of-way. The demolition required to construct the addition includes portions of the rear façade and the existing one-story addition on the rear of the home, which is not included in the purview of the the Historic Preservation Commission. After construction of the new addition, the home will have an additional 18.5 feet in length added to the primary elevation resulting in an interior side yard setback of 14 feet 4 inches, compliant with the R2 zoning district yard requirements. Features of the new addition include installing balustrades along the 2nd story roof ridge, asphalt shingles, fascia and gutters, wood corner boards and lap siding, and a cap and water table detail above the proposed new natural stone foundation - all to match the existing materials on the principal structure. The addition will feature 1/1 casement windows with wood pediment head casing and sill and painted to match the existing windows on the home. Newly proposed features include composite eave brackets along the full length of the roof line.

The proposed front porch is designed to replicate the historic front porch that previously existed in the same location. The applicant cited historic photos of the primary facade from the late 1800's as a reference for this improvement. The porch will be approximately 14.5 feet by 5 feet and constructed just south of the entryway. The applicant states that the original pilasters remaining on the front walls will be utilized in the design. Other features of the proposed covered porch include asphalt shingles to match existing, painted composite corbels and wood beams, chamfered cedar posts with historic details, wood decking, cedar guardrails, cedar skirting, and natural stone piers.

The proposed entryway roof will be sloped to match the original door pediment, the staircase decking, and brackets are to match the proposed eave brackets along the second-floor roof line, and feature wood posts and railings to match the proposed recreation of the historic porch. The proposed eave brackets are one form of ornamentation often found in historic Italianate style architecture.

The existing fireplace chimney will be demolished from the south elevation and a new fireplace chimney will be constructed flush with the south elevation and within the footprint of the proposed addition. The existing fireplace is not historic and not a significant feature of the home.

A COA is required because the work proposed will impact the exterior architectural appearance of the primary façade and modify the principal structure's primary façade as described in Section 6-11-8 of the Municipal Code. The attached Architectural Plans for the Ladd House Renovation and Addition reflect the new construction and demolition proposed.

The *Historic Building Design and Resource Manual* states that the placement of additions should have minimal impact on the building's overall character, designed in the same architectural style as the original building including roof shape, window and door design, location, and dimensions, and the overall proportion or form of the building. Also, the scale should correspond to the existing building, materials should match the predominant materials on the existing building, and massing should relate to the existing structure. The style of the front porch should match the style of the principal building and is meant to complement the overall design, connect the house to the street, and contain decorative details.

Additions that are encouraged should include subtle differences from the original building. Acceptable additions include an addition to the secondary façade that is properly designed to complement the

original building and set back from the primary façade, and to respect the original building's style and materials. The applicant appears to have proposed materials to match the existing structure and set back the addition from the primary façade. The applicant states that the plans will maintain the features currently existing on the primary façade and include details consistent with the Italianate architectural style. Porches that are encouraged should be based on physical or photographic evidence and be constructed from acceptable materials such as using wood or brick for porch columns, wood or original materials for railings, skirting, and ceilings, and wood, original material, or fiber cement for flooring and trim. The applicant provided historical photographs of the original covered front porch and the design seems to align with the location and design of the historic porch by replicating the guardrails, columns, and skirting.

Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application: Review of COA applications are conducted based on the compatibility with the Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Section 6-11-8:5; Certificate of Appropriateness Required). The owner has detailed their justification of the factors considered. Their justification is included in the attachments for review by the HPC.

Key Takeaways

- The applicant requests approval of COA 24-0533 to allow for a two-story addition to a secondary façade that impacts the exterior architectural appearance of the primary façade of the principal structure, a new covered front porch, new entryway roof, and removal of the existing fireplace chimney.