



Legislation Text

File #: 23-0630, Version: 1

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM

ACTION REQUESTED:

Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for 146 N Loomis Street - COA 23-1004

DEPARTMENT: Transportation, Engineering and Development

SUBMITTED BY: Adam Beaver, AICP Candidate, Community Planner

BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:

Submitted for Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review.

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is an approximately 7,500 square foot parcel south of School Street on the east side of Loomis Street, with a common street address of 146 N Loomis Street. The property is zoned R2 (Single-family and Low Density Multiple-Family Residence District) and is currently improved with a two-story Queen Anne - free classic home, a non-conforming detached garage, and a non-conforming detached accessory structure. The subject property is listed as a "contributing" structure in the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey for the Historic District.

Prior changes to the original structure include replacement railings and steps on the front porch, vinyl 1/1 replacement windows in original openings, fixed shutters, two story rear addition (non-historic) as well as a replacement front door. The significant features of the residential structure identified in the survey are the hipped roof with pent gable front bay, gabled south bay with cutaway corners, as well as the historic hipped roof front porch with classical wooden columns. There was a prior COA approval in 2010 for a front porch remodel as well as two administratively approved COAs in 2010 for an in-kind replacement of ceiling, deck, and steps of the front porch as well as an in-kind replacement of the roof and skirting of the front porch.

DISCUSSION:

The applicant and property owners, John and Elizabeth Harvey, seek a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to allow for a change in material for the front porch steps. The owners are requesting to remove the wooden front porch stairs and install stone stairs including limestone piers and risers. The owners are also proposing to install painted wooden railings and balusters to match existing upper railings.

A COA is required because a change in stair material as described in Section 6-11-8 of the Municipal Code is proposed. Please see the attached building plan for the new construction proposed.

The Historic Building Design and Resource Manual (HBDRM), encourages owners to maintain the original dimensions and materials of the existing porch. While the porch design itself is more consistent with the Queen Anne style, introducing new materials on the stairs that are not listed under acceptable modifications are considered Discouraged by the HBDRM. In regard to the owner's request, the HBDRM would encourage them to replace the existing wood front porch stairs with wood or composite materials and discourage them from introducing stone stairs. It should be noted that while there is a stone foundation on the existing house, the existing stairs are wooden.

In their responses, the applicant mentions that the proposed stone stairs match those of other homes in the historic district, however staff recognizes that there are many different historical styles of homes in the district and each style is unique from each other in character.

Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application: Review of COA applications are conducted based on the compatibility with the Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Section 6-11-8:5; Certificate of Appropriateness Required). The owner has detailed their justification of the factors considered. Their justification is included in the application attachment for review by the HPC. Staff understands the petitioner's desire to replace the existing porch stairs with a material that does not degrade; however, staff does believe that there are other composite materials that could achieve the same goal while providing a more historically accurate appearance.

Key Takeaways

- The applicant requests approval of COA 23-1004 to construct stone front porch stairs at 146 N Loomis Street.