



Legislation Text

File #: 20-1239, Version: 2

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM

ACTION REQUESTED:

Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for 219 North Ellsworth Street - COA 20-3281

DEPARTMENT: Transportation, Engineering and Development

SUBMITTED BY: Kathleen Russell, Community Planner

BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:

Submitted for Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review.

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is an approximately 6,875 square foot parcel located on the west side of North Ellsworth Street, just north of School Street, with a common street address of 219 North Ellsworth Street. The property is zoned R2 (Single-family and Low Density Multiple-Family Residence District) and is currently improved with a two story, Craftsman house and detached garage. The residence is identified as a "contributing" structure in the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey for the Historic District and notes it has undergone alterations including replacement of the windows, aluminum siding, porch addition, the rear entry and a two-story rear addition. The significant features identified in the survey are the broad front gable roof, front gable porch with brick knee walls, and the 3/1 wood windows under gable.

DISCUSSION:

In July 2020, the homeowners, Joseph and Courtney Alvarez, altered portions of the front façade of the home located at 219 North Ellsworth Street. The alterations completed include covering the existing red brick on the façade (including the brick knee walls) with natural cast Bristol stone. Unfortunately, the homeowners were not aware of the requirement to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) before completing this work. The City's Code Enforcement Team issued a stop work order once it became aware of the work that was being done; however, the work was largely completed by the time staff visited the site. At that time, City staff advised the homeowners that they would be required to seek approval of a COA in order to maintain the façade as currently completed.

At this time, the homeowners have submitted a COA to allow for the alterations that have been made to the façade brick portion of the home (to a natural cast Bristol stone) to remain. A COA is required because the proposal is to change a material on the primary façade as described in [Section 6-11-8](https://library.municode.com/il/naperville/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT6ZORE_CH11HIPR_6-11-8CEAPRE) [<https://library.municode.com/il/naperville/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT6ZORE_CH11HIPR_6-11-8CEAPRE>](https://library.municode.com/il/naperville/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT6ZORE_CH11HIPR_6-11-8CEAPRE). Please see the attached photos for the proposed

materials.

The Historic Building Design and Resource Manual (adopted in 2010) encourages the retention and preservation of the original masonry materials. It is acceptable to replace the original material with brick that matches the original in size and texture, as well as mortar joint profile and width. It is discouraged to cover the masonry or use veneer to imitate the masonry. Wood, stone or stucco are considered typical siding for Craftsman homes. The brick knee walls are considered a significant feature of the home and are a part of the portion of the façade that has been changed to stone.

Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application: Review of COA applications are conducted based on the compatibility with the Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application ([Section 6-11-8.5; Certificate of Appropriateness Required <https://library.municode.com/il/naperville/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT6ZORE_CH11HIPR_6-11-8CEAPRE>](https://library.municode.com/il/naperville/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT6ZORE_CH11HIPR_6-11-8CEAPRE)). The applicant has detailed their justification of the factors for consideration and is included in the attachments for review by the HPC. The work was completed prior to approval, and the stone was placed over a significant feature identified in the 2008 survey: the brick knee walls. If the COA is approved an after the fact building permit will be required. If the COA is denied, the petitioner would be required to return to the original material (if possible), submit a new proposal, or appeal the HPC's decision to the City Council.

Key Takeaways

- The petitioner is requesting approval of COA 20-3281 to cover the existing brick at the base of the primary façade with stone at 219 North Ellsworth Street.