



Legislation Text

File #: 19-535, Version: 1

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM

ACTION REQUESTED:

Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) request to construct a new single family residential home on the property located at 26 N. Sleight -COA 19-402

DEPARTMENT: Transportation, Engineering and Development

SUBMITTED BY: Gabrielle Mattingly

BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:

On April 16, 2019, the City Council considered the petitioner's request to appeal the HPC's denial of the COA to permit demolition of the existing structure located at 26 N. Sleight. Following discussion, the City Council concurred with the petitioner and approved the requested demolition (vote 7 in favor; 1 opposed).

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is located on the corner of Sleight Street and Franklin Avenue with a common address of 26 N. Sleight. The property is approximately 9,693 square feet and is presently zoned R2 (Single-Family and Low-Density Multiple-Family Residence District). The existing home is a 2 story, Vernacular Gable Front architectural style residential home. According to the historic survey conducted in 2008, the property is classified as a contributing structure.

The applicants, DJK Custom Homes, Inc. on behalf of the potential new homeowners, Christopher and Mary Anne Yep, submitted an application to demolish and construct a new single-family home at 26 N. Sleight (COA 19-402). The request was reviewed by the HPC on March 21, 2019. At the time, the COA was submitted for both demolition of the existing structure and review of the proposed single-family home. The HPC voted separately on the demolition and construction of the single-family home. The vote for demolition resulted in no recommendation (tie 4,4). Following the vote on the demolition, the HPC moved to table consideration of the COA for the proposed new single-family home (approved to table 8, 0).

Request to Appeal to City Council

Following conclusion of the HPC meeting, the applicants sought to move forward with the demolition request and appealed the tie vote (vote 4,4) provided by the HPC to the City Council. Per the requirements in Section 6-11-8:4.6 (Appeals to City Council) the applicants attended the City Council meeting on April 16, 2019. The City Council reviewed the request to appeal and approved the demolition of the existing structure (approved 7,1). City Council's review of the demolition request is final; therefore, no further HPC action is needed with respect to the demolition of the existing structure. Per City of Naperville Municipal Code Section 6-11-8:2.8, a COA, subject to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) approval, is required for review of the primary façade of any new

principal structure.

DISCUSSION:

Proposed Home

The Historic Building Design and Resource Manual (HDBRM) identifies guidelines for new residential buildings (p. 64-66). A copy of these guidelines can be found below. Staff has included a response to these guidelines relative to the proposed building. In addition, the petitioner has provided a response to each of the guidelines and a response to each of the factors for consideration in the attachments.

New Residential Building Guidelines

- **Style** - To preserve the integrity of a historic neighborhood, any new buildings must be carefully designed to maintain the style and character of the block. The existing home is a vernacular gable front in style. The HDBRM describes the vernacular style to be “farmhouse” with varying substyles such as: gable front, gabled ell, the L-form, the I-house, and the upright/wing styles. The majority of the homes along this block of Sleight street are vernacular in architectural style. The design intent of the new residence is a farm-style home with steep gable roof lines.
- **Scale** - Scale is the apparent size of a building in relationship to its neighbors as well as the relative size of building elements to each other and to the building as a whole. The homes along the block vary in number of stories from 1.5 to 2.5. The proposed home is a 1 story home, but is designed to appear like a 1 ½ story home. The petitioner has indicated that the proposed home will have approximately 3,384 square feet of gross floor area, with a 235 square feet screened-in porch, and a 530 square feet front porch. The proposed detached garage is 751 square feet. The previous structure had approximately 1,880 square feet of gross floor area with a 545 square foot garage.
- **Massing** - Massing or shape refers to the three-dimensional form exhibited by a residence. Massing is related to specific styles. The massing for new residential buildings should relate to the existing residences on the block. The massing along the block varies with the Vernacular sub styles.
- **Placement** - Placement refers to the orientation of a new structure and its setback as compared to the surrounding buildings on the block. The proposed home is setback 25' from the property line adjacent to Sleight Street with a covered porch at 20' from the property line. The setback varies along Franklin Avenue from a minimum of 18' to a maximum of 22'. The porch on Franklin avenue is located approximately 12' 6" and the patio is located 10' from the property line. The setbacks are in compliance with the code with the R2 district minimum setback of 25'. The neighboring homes vary in setback along Sleight Street with the majority of the homes setback anywhere between 18'-22'.
- **Materials** - Material selection used on a new residence should be guided by the historic buildings on its particular block. The petitioner provided the following summary of building materials: fiber cement siding with 4" to 7" exposure; wood porch columns and railings; stone knee wall, aluminum clad windows with clean square exterior casing; and asphalt shingled roofs with similar pitch to existing.
- **Foundation height** - The foundation height of a new building should be similar to the

foundation height of the residences found on the block. The proposed foundation height is approximately the same height as the original home and will have a stone veneer as indicated by the petitioner.

City Council Review of Proposed Home

During review of the proposed demolition of the existing structure located at 26 N. Sleight Street, the City Council noted some concern that the style of the proposed home did not fit in with the styles found in the historic district and requested that this be taken into account when reviewing the proposed home. It should be noted that the City Council will not review the COA for the proposed home, unless the HPC's decision is again appealed.

Review of Zoning Requirements

Staff has reviewed the proposed home and provided comments to the petitioner regarding potential variances based on the design. The applicant addressed all review comments and altered the plans to comply. At this time, the proposal complies with the Municipal Code requirements.

Key Takeaways

- DJK Custom Homes, Inc. and the potential new homeowners, Christopher and Mary Anne Yep, have submitted COA #19-402 for construction a new single family home at 26 N. Sleight.
- Review by the Historic Preservation Commission is required for the primary façade of the new principal structure.