



Legislation Text

File #: 19-534, Version: 1

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM

ACTION REQUESTED:

Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) request for the property located at 32 S. Wright St.
- COA 19-1455

DEPARTMENT: Transportation, Engineering and Development

SUBMITTED BY: Gabrielle Mattingly

BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:

Submitted for Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review.

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is an approximately 11,193 square foot parcel located on the east side of Wright Street, just north of Van Buren Avenue, with a common street address of 32 S. Wright Street. The property is zoned R2 (Single-family and Low Density Multiple-Family Residence District) and is currently improved with a frame, two story, Queen Anne style house and a detached garage. The subject property is identified as a "contributing" structure in the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey for the Historic District and notes it has undergone major non-historic additions including a two story rear addition, a single-story addition on the south façade, and a rear screen porch and deck addition.

The subject property was previously granted two COA's: a COA in 2003 permitting the demolition and replacement of the detached garage (HSC #03-11) and a COA in 2016 permitting a single story addition, a screened in porch, and a deck to the rear of the home (COA #16-942). COA #16-942 was never constructed. Administrative COAs were granted in 2010 and 2014. COA #10-1640 approved the cladding of the cast concrete foundation of the rear addition with stone veneer. COA #14-4422 approved the removal of the existing masonry chimney from the roof. The former chimney opening was covered with asphalt shingles.

DISCUSSION:

The homeowners, Andrew and Susan Fitch, seek a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to allow for changes to the façade that include: an addition on the rear of the home facing Van Buren Avenue, a new window facing Van Buren Street, a new window facing Wright Street, new porch rails and spindles, an alteration to the style of an existing window, and a window replacement. The subject property is on a corner lot, therefore, both street facing façades are subject to review by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Previous COA

The homeowners proposed a larger addition to the rear of the home in 2016 through COA #16-942.

This addition was planned to be in the same location as the proposed addition before the Commission. This addition was approved, but was not constructed. The homeowners have since had new plans drawn up for a smaller addition. More detailed information regarding the addition and proposed changes is provided below:

Addition

The homeowner is proposing to construct a 6' by 15' 8" addition on the rear of the home. The addition is minor in size and is placed at the rear using the following materials: veneer cut stone foundation, wood siding with 3" reveal, wood corner boards, architectural asphalt shingles, and new wood soffits, fascia, gutter and frieze boards to match existing. The petitioner is also proposing remove the non-historic components of the deck and rebuild and recover the deck. New railings, spindles, and skirts to match the existing front porch will be installed. The material will be treated yellow pine.

Windows

The petitioner requests to install a new window on the Wright Street facing façade, install a new window on the Van Buren Avenue façade, change the style of an existing window on the Van Buren Avenue façade, and replace an existing window in-kind, but shifting the window slightly west on the Van Buren Avenue Street façade. The City of Naperville Municipal Code (Section 6-11-8:2.2) requires a COA subject to Historic Preservation Commission Approval for any proposed new windows that result in a new opening or a change in style from the existing windows.

Wright Street Window

The petitioner is proposing to install a new Marvin clad ultimate awning window on the Van Buren facing façade for a new bathroom in the interior of the home. The existing siding and exterior trim is to remain. This portion of the home is a non-historic 2 story addition.

Van Buren Avenue Windows

The petitioner is proposing to install a new window on the second floor façade facing Wright Street and shift the existing window to the west. These windows will be identical clad ultimate double hung Marvin window units. The petitioner is also proposing to alter the style of the existing arched window on the first floor and replace the window with a Marvin clad ultimate double hung window. The window will be moved 7" to the west in order to align with the window on the upper level.

Review of COA applications are conducted based on the compatibility with the Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Section 6-11-8:5; Certificate of Appropriateness Required). Based on the factors and analysis below, staff recommends approval of COA #19-1455.

Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application:

5.1. Compatibility With District Character: The Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the compatibility of the proposed improvement with the character of the historic district in terms of scale, style, exterior features, building placement and site access, as related to the primary facade (s), in rendering a decision to grant or deny a certificate of appropriateness.

Analysis: The addition and alterations are modest in nature resulting in compatibility with the district character.

5.2. Compatibility With Architectural Style: The Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider

the compatibility of the proposed improvement with the historic architectural style of the building or structure to be modified by the certificate of appropriateness request.

Analysis: The proposed addition is compatible with the Queen Anne architectural style.

The 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey identifies the subject property to have windows that are wood in material, double hung/single hung in style with 1/1 configurations. The proposed window styles and material are identified as typical attributes of a Queen Anne.

5.3. Economic Reasonableness: The Commission and the Zoning Administrator shall consider the economic reasonableness of any recommended changes determined to be necessary to bring the application into conformity with the character of the historic district.

Analysis: The proposed addition is minimal in size and the proposed alterations are reasonable while maintaining conformity with the character of the historic district.

5.4. Energy Conservation Effect: In making its determinations, the Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the effect that any recommended changes may have on energy conservation.

Analysis: The proposed changes will not result in any adverse impact on energy conservation at the Subject Property.

5.5. Application Of Regulations: The Commission and Zoning Administrator shall not impose specific regulations, limitations, or restrictions as to the height and bulk of buildings, or the area of yards or setbacks, or other open spaces, density of population, land use, or location of buildings designed for conditional uses except as applicable for compliance with the underlying zoning district.

5.5.1. The Commission however, may consider the height and bulk of buildings and area of yards or setbacks within the context of existing neighborhoods in making its determinations. The Commission shall be permitted to deny a certificate of appropriateness on the basis of height and bulk of buildings and the area of yards or setbacks only upon finding that the approval of such a request would be detrimental to the existing or historical character of its surrounding neighborhood. The Commission may adopt procedural rules concerning the type of information that it considers necessary to make such a finding.

5.5.2. The Commission's consideration of height and bulk of buildings and area of yards or setbacks shall not exempt the applicant from compliance with the provisions of this [Title 6 <https://library.municode.com/il/naperville/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT6ZORE>](https://library.municode.com/il/naperville/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT6ZORE) (Zoning Regulations).

Analysis: The proposed changes comply with the zoning requirements and require no variances.

5.6. The City's Historic Building Design and Resource Manual may be used as a resource in consideration of the above.

Analysis: The Historic Building Design and Resource Manual encourages additions to be placed at the rear of dwellings and finds additions that are designed to respect the original building's style and materials to be acceptable. The addition maintains the architectural style and is located on the rear of the building.

The Historic Building Design and Resource Manual provides guidelines for window replacement. While the manual discourages adding new non-original window openings to the primary façade, staff believes the proposed window alterations have a minor effect on the architectural style of the home. In addition, the location of the new window on the Wright Street façade is proposed on a non-historic addition therefore, it does not impact any significant architectural features of the home.

Key Takeaways

- The petitioner is requesting approval of COA 19-1455 in order to: add an addition on the rear of the home facing Van Buren Avenue; add a new window, alter the style of an existing window and replace an existing window on the façade facing Van Buren Street; install a new window on the façade facing Wright Street; and install new porch rails and spindles to the porch located in the rear at 32 S. Wright Street.
- Staff supports and recommends approval COA #19-1455.