



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 20-634 **Version:** 2

Type: Report **Status:** Filed

File created: 5/21/2020 **In control:** Historic Preservation Commission

On agenda: 5/28/2020 **Final action:** 5/28/2020

Title: Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) 127 South Columbia Street- COA 20-610

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. Application, 2. Elevations and site plan, 3. 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey, 4. Factors for Consideration Responses

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
5/28/2020	2	Historic Preservation Commission	approved	

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM

ACTION REQUESTED:

Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) 127 South Columbia Street- COA 20-610

DEPARTMENT: Transportation, Engineering and Development

SUBMITTED BY: Kathleen Russell

BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:

Submitted for Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review.

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is an approximately 12,656 square foot parcel located at the northwest corner of the Columbia Street and Chicago Avenue intersection, with a common street address of 127 South Columbia Street. The property is zoned R2 (Single-family and Low Density Multiple-Family Residence District) and is currently improved with a two story, prairie style stucco house and a two car detached garage. The subject property is identified as a "contributing" structure in the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey for the Historic District and has undergone both historic and non-historic changes including a one story historic addition and a non-historic replacement of the porch stoop, railings, and walls. The significant features identified in the survey are the broad hipped roof with overhanging eaves, a south side hipped dormer, hipped front entry canopy with large brackets, historic 3/1 wood windows, four light awning windows, and a one story south sun porch.

The subject property was previously granted a COA in 2008 permitting the construction of a deck on the west side of the home (HSC #08-12) which was constructed.

DISCUSSION:

The subject property is on a corner lot, therefore, both street facing façades are subject to review by the Historic Preservation Commission. The east facade faces Columbia Street and the south façade faces Chicago Avenue. The homeowner, Matt McNichols, seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to allow for changes to the façade that include: On the south side of the home, the existing sunroom would be demolished and replaced with a two-story addition. On the west side of the home, a new one story covered porch, addition over an existing one story portion of the home, and a cantilevered box bay would be constructed. A new one story covered porch would be added to the east side of the home. The proposed changes will add a family room, a bedroom with a closet, and additional outdoor covered spaces. A COA is required because major work is proposed on the primary façades of the principle building as described in 6-11-8. Please see the attached site plan for the new construction and demolition proposed. More detailed information regarding the proposed changes and guidelines on the proposed changes as found in the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual (adopted in 2010) is provided below:

North side (Facing adjacent property): A hip attic dormer will be added with matching roofing, gutters and stucco to the existing home. It is acceptable in the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual (design guidelines) to add dormers consistent to the style and materials of the home on secondary or rear facades.

East side (Facing Columbia Street): Covered Porch

The petitioner would like to add a one story open covered porch. Demolition would not be required on this side of the home. The porch would match the existing roofing, beams, columns, guardrail and stucco material. It is acceptable to construct new porches that are appropriate to the style and period of the home in overall design and scale according to the design guidelines.

South side (Facing Chicago Avenue): Demolition and Addition

The homeowner is proposing to construct a two-story 20' x 15' addition on the south side of the home after demolition of the existing 12' x 10' sunroom. The sunroom was identified in the 2008 survey as a significant feature to the home. The addition would match the existing home features including roof pitch, overhang, fascia, gutters, roofing, and exposed foundation. The proposed changes would address several concerns the petitioner has with the sunroom including the lack of insulation, sloped flooring which limits use of the space, temperature variation in the home due to lack of closure between home and sunroom, and separation of the sunroom from the home resulting in cracks along the joints. Additions to the primary façade are discouraged in the design guidelines. This addition is not a totally new structure because it would be replacing the open sunroom on the first floor, however the petitioner is proposing to add another room on the second story where one previously did not exist.

West side (Facing Wright Street Alley): Open Porch, Second Floor Addition, and Cantilevered Box Bay

The petitioner would like to add a one story covered porch with a balcony on the second floor that would match the existing roofing, handrails, and stucco material. They would also construct a second story floor addition over the existing first floor that would be attached to the new porch. Lastly, a cantilevered box bay would be added on the first story. The box bay will be added to the portion of the west side of the home closest to Chicago Avenue, so it will be visible from the street. The rear of the property is noted as the best location for additions to minimize impact on the building's character.

Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application: Review of COA applications are conducted based on the compatibility with the Factors for Consideration of a

Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Section 6-11-8:5; Certificate of Appropriateness Required). The applicant has detailed their justification of the factors considered. Their justification is included in the attachments for review by the HPC. Staff raises concern with the proposed removal of the sunroom given it is identified as a significant feature of the home in the 2008 architectural survey. Staff requests the HPC take this into consideration upon review.

Key Takeaways

- The petitioner is requesting approval of COA 20-610 to: demolish the sunroom and add an addition on the home facing Chicago Avenue, add a new one story porch facing Columbia Street, and add a new second floor addition over an existing first floor, covered porch and cantilevered box bay in the rear at 127 South Columbia Street.