



Legislation Text

---

File #: 23-0291, Version: 1

---

**CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM**

**ACTION REQUESTED:**

Approve the award of RFP 22-343, Springbrook Water Reclamation Center South Plant Expansion project, to Donohue & Associates, Inc. for an amount not to exceed \$2,288,763.00 plus a 3% contingency

**DEPARTMENT:** Water Utilities

**SUBMITTED BY:** Darrell Blenniss, Director

**BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:**

N/A

**BACKGROUND:**

In 2022, Water Utilities completed a Request for Qualifications (RFQ 22-109) for Springbrook Water Reclamation Center (SWRC) consulting engineering services. The following four consultants were shortlisted for a three-year term as a result of this process:

1. Black & Veatch Corporation
2. Carollo Engineers
3. CDM Smith
4. Donohue & Associates

The City of Naperville recently completed a Facilities Plan for SWRC that identified a long-term plan for improvements to be in compliance with the City's National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit and anticipated future regulations, particularly related to nutrient removal.

In December 2022, the Water Utilities issued RFP 22-343, Springbrook Water Reclamation Center South Plant Expansion, to select one of the shortlisted consultants for this project. This project involves design engineering, permitting and bid phase services to the south plant expansion with additional aeration basins and clarifiers to treat half of the projected future flow.

**DISCUSSION:**

Advertisement Date: December 14, 2022

Notices Sent: 4

Opening Date: January 27, 2023

Plan holders: 4

Proposals Received: 2

Proposals were received from the following vendors:

Black & Veatch Corporation  
Donohue & Associates, Inc.

A selection team comprised of staff from Water Utilities evaluated the proposals, which were scored based upon the criteria set forth in the RFP:

1. Capability, Capacity and Qualifications of the Firm (15%)
2. Suitability and Quality of the Approach/Methodology (45%)
3. Milestones and Deliverables (25%)
4. Outcomes to be Achieved (15%)

After review and scoring of the proposals, the selection committee determined that the vendor with the highest qualification score, Donohue & Associates Inc., is recommended to further negotiating the costs. The table below provides a summary of the final qualification scores:

Vendor	Qualification Score
Black & Veatch Corporation	81.35
Donohue & Associates, Inc.	85.8

After negotiations, Donohue & Associates, Inc. was able to lower the proposed costs from initially \$2,531,500 to \$2,288,763. This cost is still slightly higher than Black & Veatch Corporation's cost of \$1,966,855. However, Black & Veatch proposes a relatively new Biological Nutrient Removal (BNR) technology. In staff's opinion, introducing this new technology in Springbrook carries the following risks:

1. The BNR technology has not been widely used enough to prove its reliability.
2. The online treatment facilities that use this technology have not been operational for a long enough period to prove the results of this treatment method.
3. This technology does not match what Springbrook North Plant currently has and can create operational complexity in the future.

In addition, Black & Veatch's proposal disregards the nutrients removal evaluation and technology that was identified in the Springbrook Facility Plan. Therefore, after carefully evaluating the risks, staff's final recommendation is to award the project to Donohue & Associates, Inc. for the following reasons:

1. Compared to Black & Veatch, the method proposed by Donohue & Associates, Inc. is more mature and reliable.
2. Donohue & Associates, Inc.'s proposal includes Alternate Phosphorus Removal Evaluation, which is important for the project.

The selected consultant was a member of the Facilities Plan and UV Disinfection design team, designed the North Plant RAS Grit System, which has operated successfully since 2016. They have also been awarded the South Plant RAS Grit Improvements project, which is currently under design. Therefore, the selected consultant is very familiar with SWRC facilities and operations.

**FISCAL IMPACT:**

**CIP#: WW045 - SWRC South Plant Capacity Upgrades & Improvements**

Design cost for the SWRC plant is expensed to the account number below. A total of \$4.9 million was approved for this project as part of the 2023 Capital improvement program. The requested award is within budget. Future years' costs associated with this project will be updated accordingly throughout each budget process.

<b>Account Number</b>	<b>Fund Description</b>	<b>Total Budgeted Amount</b>
41252000-551502	Water Capital Fund	\$39,813,900