



Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 24-0034 **Version:** 1

Type: Report **Status:** Agenda Ready

File created: 1/5/2024 **In control:** Historic Preservation Commission

On agenda: 1/25/2024 **Final action:** 1/25/2024

Title: Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for 223 Center Street - COA 23-4821

Sponsors:

Indexes:

Code sections:

Attachments: 1. HPC COA Application, 2. Revised Architectural Plans, 3. Narrative - Scope of Demolition, 4. 12_15_23 Photo of Illegal Demolition 1, 5. 12_15_23 Photo of Illegal Demolition 2, 6. Public Comment on COA 23-4821 - 223 Center Street

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
1/25/2024	1	Historic Preservation Commission	denied	Fail

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM

ACTION REQUESTED:

Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for 223 Center Street - COA 23-4821

DEPARTMENT: Transportation, Engineering and Development

SUBMITTED BY: Brad Iwicki, Assistant Planner

BOARD/COMMISSION REVIEW:

Submitted for Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review.

BACKGROUND:

The subject property is an approximately 7,500 square foot parcel south of North Avenue and on the west side of Center Street, with a common street address of 223 Center Street. The property is zoned R2 (Single-family and Low Density Multiple-Family Residence District) and is currently improved with a two-story upright and wing style home (as identified by the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey), shed, and a detached garage located near the rear of the property. The subject property is listed as a “contributing” structure in the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey for the Historic District.

Significant features of the residence include the two-story front gable bay with south side gable wing. Prior changes to the original structure include a two-story rear addition, replacement front porch, south chimney addition, double door added to the south wall of the front bay (under porch), replacement windows in the original window openings, and installation of fixed shutters and aluminum siding.

Prior COA Approvals

- COA 22-4462 was approved for this property to increase the height of the roof, remove the south deck, and improve the home with a two-story rear addition. The scope of work approved with this COA was never initiated.
- COA 23-3770 was approved for this property to increase the height of the roof and install replacement windows in new window openings and a change in material (approved COA provided in Related Files).

DISCUSSION:

Illegal Demolition Activity

Following approval of COA 23-3770 by the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on October 26, 2023, the City issued a building permit for the subject property. The drawings submitted with the building permit were consistent with the plans approved through COA 23-3770.

During an inspection conducted by City staff on December 15, 2023, it was determined that the demolition work that had been undertaken at the subject property (photos provided in attachments) far exceeded the scope of work approved through COA 23-3770, as well as the approved building permit. At that time, a Stop Work Order was posted on the property by City Code Enforcement and the project was stopped after foundation backfill was completed.

On December 18, 2023, City staff met with the petitioners, Moses Khalil and Khaled Hasan, to discuss the current state of the project and steps to rectify the illegal demolition at 223 Center Street. Staff informed the petitioners that a new COA request is required, including a new COA application and revised plans to reflect the scope of demolition and construction work proposed on site. The petitioner will also be required to amend the building permit plans accordingly for review by plan review staff. No additional work can be completed at the subject property until a revised COA and building permit are issued.

New COA Request

On January 3, 2024, the petitioners submitted a new COA application and revised plans for the subject property (COA 23-4821).

Architectural plans for the revised scope of demolition and the new construction proposed are provided in the attachments. The current COA request includes:

- **Additional Demolition:** COA 23-3770 approved demolition of a portion of the primary façade in order to increase the height of the roof system. The petitioner's demolition exceeded the approved COA and included demolition of the front porch roofing and rafters, the primary façade (east wall) above the porch overhang, and the walls on the north and south elevation of the residence. The current COA seeks approval of the additional demolition work that has already been completed on site.

The 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey for the Historic District identified the home at the subject property as an upright and wing style home. The Survey lists the two-story front gable bay with south side gable wing as significant features of the home. The petitioner states that the gable roof features will remain.

- **New Windows:** The petitioner is requesting approval of a COA to allow the construction of two new window openings and installation of new windows on the 2nd floor east wall above the porch overhang, as well as replacement of three first floor windows using vinyl material. The

windows to be installed are double-hung, vinyl windows featuring thermopane and low-e glazing to improve energy use.

The Historic Building and Design Manual encourages retaining and preserving windows in their original location, size, type, and design, and with their original materials and pane division. It appears that the applicant is proposing to add two 2nd floor window openings to match the design and size of the existing openings, and replace three existing 1st floor windows. The applicant plans to install vinyl windows; however, vinyl and fiberglass window material and adding new non-original window openings to the primary façade are discouraged in the Historic District per the Historic Building and Design Manual. The addition of two window openings on the east wall above the front porch overhang was briefly discussed at the October 26th HPC meeting, where the Commission showed support for this potential improvement.

Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application: Review of COA applications are conducted based on the compatibility with the Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Section 6-11-8:5; Certificate of Appropriateness Required). The owner has detailed their justification of the factors considered. Their justification is included in the attachments for review by the HPC.

The petitioner has provided required notice of the requested COA, as stipulated in the Naperville Municipal Code, in advance of the January 25, 2024 HPC meeting.

Key Takeaways

- The applicant requests approval of COA 23-4821 to allow for the demolition of the primary façade without replacement of original architectural features, two new 2nd floor window openings with use of vinyl material, and replacement of 1st floor windows with use of vinyl material.