



Meeting Minutes

Historic Preservation Commission

Thursday, May 28, 2020

7:00 PM

Held on Zoom due to COVID-19

A. CALL TO ORDER:

B. ROLL CALL:

Present: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Franczyk, Eveslage, Ory, Chairman Peterson, Urda, Councilman Kelly (non-voting), Howard (non-voting)
Absent: Fessler, Mohammadian (student representative), Sanjay (student representative)

C. PUBLIC FORUM:

Becky Simon from Naperville Preservation Inc. requested the Historic Preservation Commission use the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual to evaluate future development.

D. OLD BUSINESS:

E. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) 127 South Columbia Street- COA 20-610

Homeowners Matt and Jenifer McNichols presented the case and summarized the proposed additions to the home.

Chairman Peterson asked clarifying questions concerning the proposed new chimney and its similarity to the existing chimney.

Matt and Jenifer McNichols confirmed the new chimney would match the masonry and stucco of the existing chimney.

Commissioner Ory asked if the dormer on the Chicago elevation is removed through the proposed changes.

Jenifer McNichols confirmed the dormer is removed in the roofline but was added to the north elevation.

Vice Chair Jacks showed concern for the proposed second floor balcony.

Commissioner Urda asked if they would feel more comfortable with a covered balcony.

Matt and Jennifer McNichols explained the second story porch would be in the rear of the home and would be hidden in the roofline.

Chairman Peterson noted that the addition is pretty far back on the property from the street which is difficult to see on the two-dimensional drawing.

Tom Ryan, project architect, noted that the second-floor balcony is disguised within the hip roof.

Commissioner Urda noted that the sunroom change is a significant improvement, which pushes the edge of the historic aspect, but he believes the changes are artfully done.

Chairman Peterson said he was on board with the front porch and rear covered porch along with the box bay also in the rear. He also noted the removal of significant elements of the dormer and the sunroom and the implication of creating a precedent.

Commissioner Ory agreed with the setting of a precedent, but also stated that the Commission should base judgement on a case by case basis.

Public Testimony: None

Commissioner Garrison stated that the outcomes of the improvements outweigh the loss of the features and would be in support.

Commissioner Doyle agreed with Commissioner Garrison.

Matt and Jenifer McNichols thanked the Commissioners and expressed they are looking forward to the usable space.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Jacks and seconded by Commissioner Urda to approve COA #20-610 to: demolish the sunroom and add an addition on the home facing Chicago Avenue, add a new one story porch facing Columbia Street, and add a new second floor addition over an existing first floor, covered porch and cantilevered box bay in the rear at 127 South Columbia Street.

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Franczyk, Eveslage, Ory, Chairman

Peterson, and Urda.

Nays: None

2. Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) 209 North Brainard Street - COA 20-987

Brian Ledebuhr, homeowner, described the proposed changes to the home including changes to the front covered porch and the addition of a sunroom window. He also noted a small covered porch would also be added in the rear, but is not visible from the street.

Chairman Peterson listed two discrepancies in the report including the description of the proposed porch as enclosed and the description that the new porch roof would maintain the existing roofing. He noted these were not accurate and asked for clarification.

Tom Ryan clarified that the front porch would not be enclosed and that the metal roof of the porch would match the existing metal roof on the current porch, but not the roof of the home. He also explained that the metal roof elevates the offset entry and its importance.

Public Testimony: None

Chairman Peterson commented that he has no issues with the new sunroom windows, but is concerned with the changes to the significant feature front entry, specifically the pediment.

Tom Ryan explained that the gable limits the width of the porch whereas the proposed hip roof allows for an expanded width of the porch.

Commissioner Urda asked for clarification on the terminology of the gable and hip.

Tom Ryan explained the use of the hip and gable is not sheltering and is an architectural detail.

Vice Chair Jacks commented the differences between the CAD drawings shown during the meeting and the submitted elevations in the packet.

Chairman Peterson agreed it was not in the packet.

Kathleen Russell, Planning Services Team, confirmed that the

drawing displayed at the meeting were sent after the memo was published.

Brian Ledebuhr, confirmed that the fireplace shown in the CAD drawing is attached to the sunroom.

Vice Chair Jacks asked to confirm the only rear changes to vote on were the sunroom windows.

Chairman Peterson described that they are only voting on the windows on the sunroom and the new proposed porch in the front of the home.

Brian Ledebuhr thanked all for their time and asked if the consideration of the fireplace would require a new COA.

Vice Chair Jacks stated his opinion is that a new COA would be required for the fireplace.

Chairman Peterson noted the fireplace would not be a bad thing, but could not see how it could be included in the COA proposed tonight. Peterson also asked if the petitioner would like to return with a modified proposal.

Brian Ledebuhr stated it made sense to vote on the original request tonight rather than bringing forth all the changes at once with the fireplace at another time.

A motion was made by Commissioner Ory and seconded by Commissioner Doyle to approve COA 20-987 to add a porch at the front of the home facing Brainard Street and replace the existing windows on the sunroom facing School Street at 209 North Brainard Street

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Franczyk, Eveslage, Ory, Chairman Peterson, and Urda

Nays: Vice Chair Jacks

F. REPORTS

1. Approve the minutes of the January 23, 2020 Historic Preservation Commission meeting

A motion was made by Commissioner Urda seconded by Vice Chair Jacks to approve the meeting minutes of the January 23, 2020, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Franczyk, Eveslage, Chairman Peterson, Urda

Nays: None

Abstain: Ory

G. NEW BUSINESS:

Commissioner Urda brought up the recent City Council meeting agenda item of the Little Friends concept as new business. He discussed the issue of importance is the request for a blanket COA in the future.

Gabrielle Mattingly, Planning Services Team, clarified that since there is not an agenda item or application, the Little Friends site could not be specifically discussed.

Commissioner Jacks noted that the presentation is speculation until an agenda item is brought forward.

Chairman Peterson commented that the detail presented for the plan would need to be extensive with complete details for each lot.

Commissioner Urda agreed with Chairman Peterson's description and noted that each lot buyer would be required to come and present individually.

Councilmember Kelly emphasized that the concept is speculative and there are multiple different variables that are up in the air.

H. ADJOURNMENT:

8:08pm