

MEMORANDUM

To: Scott R. Miller, Vice President / Director of Development - Western Division
Retail Properties of America, Inc. (RPAI)

From: Rory Fancier-Splitt, AICP, PTP – Kimley-Horn
Tim Sjogren, P.E., PTOE – Kimley-Horn

Date: March 16, 2020

RE: Parking Summary Update for 10 S. Main Street

On behalf of Retail Properties of America, Inc. (RPAI) Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc. (Kimley-Horn) evaluated the parking supply for the mixed-use development proposed at 10 S. Main Street in Naperville, Illinois. The parking supply was reviewed relative to the City of Naperville requirements, downtown parking requirements for other suburban communities, and data collected for similar developments. This memorandum presents a review of the proposed parking supply and summarizes key findings and conclusions.

Proposed Development

The proposed development includes 47 residential units and approximately 14,060 gross square feet of retail use on the first floor. The development would include a total of 57 resident parking spaces, including 3 ADA spaces. A total of 9 guest spaces would be provided at Main Street Promenade East for a total of 66 spaces for the proposed development.

The resident parking supply includes one space for the one-bedroom units, and two spaces for the two-bedroom units. The onsite parking lot would be private, access controlled, and accessible to residents only. Access to the parking lot would be provided by a full-access driveway to Benton Avenue. Guest parking would be located at the adjacent Main Street Promenade East covered alley, accessible via the existing inbound driveway along Van Buren Avenue and the outbound driveway to Benton Avenue. These off-site guest parking spaces would be restricted as guest parking only for the subject development. Parking for the first-floor retail use would be eligible for the City's parking fee-in-lieu formula, subject to an amendment to the SSA 21 boundary.

Based on information from RPAI, the proposed development would be designed for active adults with onsite amenities and access to downtown commercial and recreational destinations. The demographic profile of an active adult development is different than a traditional suburban residential development. Whereas many families live in traditional suburban developments, active adult residents are commonly single- or two-person households. Active adult residents are typically retired, semi-retired, or approaching retirement. These residents may be downsizing and want to stay in their established neighborhood or relocating in order to be near family in Naperville. An active adult residential development typically fills the gap between a traditional single-family home and care-continuum housing.

City of Naperville Requirements

Off-street parking requirements for the proposed development are defined in Section 6-9-3 (Schedule of Off-Street Parking Requirements) of the Naperville Municipal Code. Pursuant to Section 6-9-3.8, the Continuous Improvement Model (CIM) parking ratio of 2.04 spaces per 1,000 square feet of gross floor area applies to nonresidential properties within the Downtown Parking Map. Consistent with Ordinance 08-200 (CIM), the proposed development will seek inclusion into the SSA 21 boundary. Accordingly, the proposed development would be subject to payment of the parking fee-in-lieu and shared parking for the retail use would be provided within the public parking decks along with the annual SSA taxes paid by the subject property.

Per Section 6-9-3.7 of the Municipal Code, a residential development is required to provide two spaces per unit. For duplex, single-family attached, and multi-family developments, the Code requires an additional 0.25 spaces per unit for guests. Based on the Code, a total of 2.25 spaces per unit are required for all apartment developments, regardless of location, demographics, and bedroom mix. Therefore, a two-bedroom unit is subject to the same parking ratio as a one-bedroom single-person unit. Furthermore, an apartment development in downtown Naperville is subject to the same parking ratio as other developments throughout the city.

In contrast, some communities specify different requirements for various residential product types (e.g., single-family detached, apartment/condominium) in order to address the unique parking demand characteristics of these uses. In addition, these communities provide different parking requirements for downtown residential uses in order to reflect the reduced parking demand associated with proximity to commercial and recreational destinations and increased access to multimodal transportation. In each community, a variance to the parking requirements may be considered based on the unique characteristics of a residential development. A summary of residential parking ratios for other suburban communities is provided in **Table 1** on the following page.

Table 1. Comparison of Residential Parking Requirements

Community	Single-Family Detached	Apartment / Condo	
		Downtown	Other
Naperville	2 spaces / unit	2.25 spaces / unit	
Downers Grove	2 spaces / unit	1.4 spaces / unit ¹	2.0 spaces / unit
Wilmette	2 spaces / unit	1 / unit < 2 bedrooms 1.5 / unit ≥ 2 bedrooms ²	2.0 spaces / unit
Highland Park	2 spaces / unit	1 / unit: 0-999 sq. ft. 1.5 / unit: 1,000-1,699 sq. ft. 2 / unit: 1,700 sq. ft.+ 0.1 / unit: guest ³	1.25 / unit: studio 1.5 / unit: 1-bedroom 2 / unit: 2-bedroom+ 0.25 / unit: guest ⁴

¹ Reduced parking requirement of 1.4 spaces per unit applies to apartment and condominium developments in Downtown Business or Downtown Core zoning districts.

² Reduced parking requirements of 1.0 spaces per studio or 1-bedroom unit and 1.5 unit for any 2-bedroom or larger units applies to Village Center zoning district.

³ Guest parking for multiple-family dwellings and mixed-use buildings in the RO, B4-4, B4-5, B4-6, and B5 zoning districts is calculated based on unit count. For buildings with 10 units or more, 0.1 spaces per dwelling is required; for buildings with less than 10 units, 0.2 spaces per dwelling is required.

⁴ Guest parking for multiple-family dwellings and mixed-use buildings outside the downtown zoning districts is 0.25 spaces per unit if ≥ 5 units; 0.5 spaces per dwelling unit if ≤ 4 units.

As shown in the table above, the City of Naperville parking requirements for apartments/condominiums are higher than Downers Grove, Wilmette, and Highland Park. In addition, each community surveyed provides distinct parking requirements for downtown apartment/condominium residential uses, whereas the Naperville Municipal Code requires 2.25 spaces per unit for all apartment/condominium uses throughout the city. Based on this parking ratio, a total of 106 parking spaces would be required for the proposed residential use as summarized in **Table 2**.

Table 2. Naperville Municipal Code Parking Requirements – Residential

Land Use	Size	Parking Ratio	Required Parking Spaces
Residential	47 units	2.25 spaces / unit	106
Total Required			106
Proposed Supply			66 ¹
Surplus / Deficit			-40

¹ Includes 57 onsite resident spaces and 9 guest spaces provided at Main Street Promenade East.

As shown in the table above, the proposed residential parking supply is less than the Code requirement; and therefore, a parking variance is requested. Strict enforcement of the Code-required parking would not reflect the unique characteristics of the proposed development as summarized below.

- The proposed development is in close proximity to the commercial, recreational, and institutional uses located in downtown Naperville. In addition, the development is within walking distance to the Naperville Metra Station. The location offers increased mobility with access to a range of multimodal options which is expected to influence vehicle ownership.
- The proposed residential use includes a mix of one-bedroom and two-bedroom units. The City's parking requirements are based on unit count, not bedroom count. Therefore, the parking demand characteristics of a one-bedroom unit are assumed to be comparable to a two-bedroom unit. Based on the proposed unit mix, approximately 92 percent of the units are one-bedroom, a portion of which may be occupied single-person households. Approximately 8 percent of the units provide two-bedrooms, a portion of which may also be occupied by single-person households. Parking demand for most of the units is expected to be less than two spaces per unit.
- The proposed residential use would be designed to meet the needs of active adults. Based on the anticipated demographic profile, the units are expected to be generally occupied by single- or two-person households, and residents will likely own fewer vehicles than a traditional suburban residential development.
- The proposed residential use would include rental units only. As such, the parking spaces would be assigned to tenants and managed through lease agreements. The lease agreements allow property management to oversee the parking supply and limit the number of spaces offered to each tenant.
- Access to the guest parking spaces would require a temporary pass from the leasing office; therefore, use of these spaces would be monitored.

The Naperville Municipal Code acknowledges reductions to the parking requirements may be considered based on the unique characteristics of the development. The proposed residential parking supply reflects the nature of the development and the surrounding built environment.

Mobility Considerations

Downtown Naperville provides convenient access to commercial, recreational, and institutional amenities. The existing transportation network provides mobility options for residents, employees, and visitors. The *Naperville Downtown2030* plan acknowledges the mix of mobility options available downtown, including access to the Naperville Metra Station and Pace Suburban Bus, an established bicycle and pedestrian network, and "niche transportation" such as the trolley and electric vehicles (e.g., Tuk Tuk Naperville). The plan acknowledges alternative transportation as an asset to downtown.

Since adoption of the *Naperville Downtown2030* plan in 2011, alternative transportation options have increased. Ridesharing (e.g., Uber, Lyft) and carsharing (e.g., Zipcar, Enterprise) are commonly used. In addition, North Central College offers a bike sharing program for students (i.e., Cardinal Red Bike Program). These changes are part of a larger shift to shared mobility, which increasingly influences personal vehicle ownership. In response to the increase in shared mobility, some Chicago suburbs have adjusted parking requirements to allow a reduction or credit where access to transit or carsharing is provided. The City of Evanston, Village of Villa Park, City of Highland Park, and City of Des Plaines each offer parking reductions ranging from 10 percent up to 40 percent of the original Code-required parking where a carsharing service is provided.

Downtown Naperville offers a variety of mobility options, and convenient access to a range of amenities. While the Municipal Code acknowledges the unique parking characteristics of downtown commercial uses through the use of the CIM parking ratio, adjustments to the parking requirements for downtown residential uses are not provided. The parking requirement of 2.25 spaces per unit does not reflect the unique amenities and mobility options available to downtown residents.

Vehicle Ownership

The mobility options in downtown Naperville, combined with the demographics anticipated for the proposed residential use, suggest tenants may own fewer vehicles than a traditional suburban residential development. Vehicle access (i.e., vehicle owned or leased¹) data is available through the U.S. Census Bureau American Community Survey (ACS). Completed most recently in 2017, the ACS provides vehicle ownership data for owner-occupied housing units and renter-occupied units. A summary of vehicle access for the census tract which includes downtown Naperville is presented in **Table 3**. In addition, data for the block group which is more specific to downtown Naperville and the immediate surrounding area is also provided.²

Table 3. Summary of Vehicle Access per 2017 U.S. Census Bureau American Community Survey

Vehicles Available	Census Tract 8465.04				Block Group 1, Census Tract 8465.04			
	Renter-Occupied		Owner-Occupied		Renter-Occupied		Owner-Occupied	
	Households	% Total	Households	% Total	Households	% Total	Households	% Total
No Vehicles	131	13.7%	36	2.5%	20	7.0%	--	--
1 Vehicle	355	37.0%	354	25.1%	127	44.3%	86	34.4%
2 Vehicles	275	28.7%	831	58.8%	99	34.5%	141	56.4%
3 Vehicles	115	12.0%	192	13.6%	27	9.4%	23	9.2%
4 Vehicles	83	8.7%	--	--	14	4.9%	--	--
5+ Vehicles	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--
Total	959	100%	1,413	100%	287	100%	250	100%

As shown in Table 3, renter-occupied households in downtown Naperville and the surrounding area generally have access to fewer vehicles than owner-occupied households. Within the overall Census Tract 8465.04 and Block Group 1, approximately 51 percent of renter-occupied households have access to one vehicle or less. In contrast, approximately 28 percent of owner-occupied households in the overall Census Tract 8465.04 have access to one vehicle or less and roughly 59 percent have access to two vehicles. Within Block Group 1, approximately 34 percent of owner-occupied households have access to one vehicle and roughly 56 percent have access to two vehicles.

¹ According to the U.S. Census Bureau, the data includes vehicles owned and vehicles rented or leased for one month or more, company vehicles, and police and government vehicles if kept at home and used for non-business purposes.

² Block Group 1, Census Tract 8465.04 is generally bounded by the BNSF Railroad to the north, Jefferson Avenue to the south, Washington Street to the east and Fremont Street to the west.

Case Study Review

National-level parking demand data does not capture the unique characteristics of suburban downtown residential developments and shared mobility trends³; therefore, a review of recently completed apartment developments in the Chicago suburbs was completed. For purposes of this analysis, comparable developments were selected based on their downtown suburban setting, density, and amenities. Each development offers rental units only; condominiums were not included in the analysis. A summary of comparable developments is presented in **Table 4** on the following page.

Table 4. Summary of Comparable Residential Developments

Development	Units	Total Bedrooms	Parking Supply	Spaces / Unit	Spaces / Bedroom
10 S. Main Street					
Total Parking Supply ¹	47	51	66	1.40	1.29
Resident Parking Only ²			57	1.21	1.12
The Residences of Wilmette Wilmette	75	119	114	1.52	0.96
Maple + Main Downers Grove	115	151	162	1.41	1.07
Burlington Station Downers Grove	89	120	102	1.15	0.85
McGovern House Highland Park	73	113	117	1.60	1.04
Average for Comparable Developments	88	126	124	1.41	0.98

¹ Reflects total parking supply, including resident and guest spaces.

² Reflects resident parking only (excludes guest parking spaces).

As shown above, the proposed total parking supply, including resident and guest parking, is equal to 1.40 spaces per unit or 1.29 spaces per bedroom. The resident parking supply (excluding guest parking spaces) is equal to 1.21 spaces per unit or 1.19 spaces per bedroom. The total parking supply exceeds the average parking ratio for spaces per bedroom for comparable developments in other suburban downtowns. Based on the four comparable developments, an average of 1.41 spaces per unit or 0.98 spaces per bedroom is provided for the residential use.

³ Data provided by the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Parking Generation, Fourth Edition manual for Low/Mid-Rise Apartment (Land Use Code 221) is based on surveys completed between 1964 and 2009; and therefore, does not reflect recent trends in mobility options, including ridesharing (e.g., Uber, Lyft) and carsharing (e.g., Zipcar, Enterprise). The ITE data provided for suburban sites reflects surveys completed across the country with the only Chicago area survey completed in Skokie in 1964; and therefore, the data is not representative of downtown Naperville. The ITE data provided for urban sites reflects surveys completed in Dallas, San Francisco, Syracuse, Santa Barbara, Long Beach, Santa Monica, and San Diego; and therefore, is not considered comparable to downtown Naperville.

For each comparable development, resident parking is assigned. The parking is gated and accessible to residents only. Spaces are assigned and managed through lease agreements. This approach is unique to rental units and allows the management office to oversee the parking supply.

Based on data obtained from the Maple + Main development, current lease agreements include an average of 1.19 spaces per unit or 0.84 spaces per bedroom. The current lease agreements indicate actual parking demand is less than the supply of 1.41 spaces per unit or 1.07 spaces per bedroom.⁴ This actual parking demand may be influenced by restrictions enforced through the lease agreements. In addition, other contributing factors may include persons per household, cost, access to alternate transportation (e.g., walking, bicycling, transit), and proximity to amenities (e.g., downtown Downers Grove).

Guest Parking

The proposed parking supply of 66 spaces includes 9 spaces at Main Street Promenade East. Of the comparable developments surveyed, only one provides designated guest spaces. The McGovern House provides two (2) spaces for guest parking. The other comparable developments have on-street parking located along the property frontage. These on-street spaces are available to the general public and subject to local parking regulations as summarized in **Table 5**.

Table 5. Summary of Comparable Residential Developments

Development	Designated Guest Parking	On-Street Public Parking
10 S. Main Street Naperville	9 spaces at MSP East	5 spaces on Main Street ¹ 4 spaces on Benton Avenue ¹
The Residences of Wilmette Wilmette	0 spaces	3 spaces on Green Bay Road Unrestricted Overnight parking prohibited
Maple + Main Downers Grove	0 spaces	7 spaces on Maple Avenue Unrestricted Overnight parking prohibited
Burlington Station Downers Grove	0 spaces	3 spaces on Gilbert Avenue No Parking M, TH, SAT 8AM-12PM Overnight parking prohibited
McGovern House Highland Park	2 spaces	10 spaces on McGovern Street 2-hour parking, 8AM-6PM M-SAT Overnight parking prohibited Dec-March

¹ On-street parking will be limited to two-hours from 6:00AM to 6:00PM, Monday thru Saturday. Overnight parking will be prohibited from 2:00AM to 5:00AM daily.

As previously mentioned, on-street parking will be located along the Main Street and Benton Avenue frontages. A total of nine (9) on-street spaces will be available to the general public, subject to the posted parking regulations.

⁴ Information about existing lease agreements was not released for The Residences of Wilmette, Burlington Station, and McGovern House.

Parking Observations

Kimley-Horn conducted parking occupancy counts at The Residences of Wilmette, Maple + Main, and McGovern House. Counts were conducted from 10:00PM to 12:00AM on a typical weekday, and from 2:00PM to 5:00PM and 10:00PM to 12:00AM on a typical Saturday. These periods were selected in order to capture peak usage when residents are home, and to evaluate guest parking conditions. A summary of key findings from this data collection effort is outlined below.

- **The resident parking supply exceeds demand.** The following occupancy levels were observed for leased spaces at the surveyed comparable developments:
 - The Residences of Wilmette: During the count periods, an average of 89 percent of leased spaces were occupied.
 - Maple + Main: During the Saturday afternoon period, an average of 67 percent of leased spaces were occupied. An average of 90 percent of leased spaces were occupied at 10:00PM on a typical weekday and Saturday.
 - McGovern House: An average of 71 percent of leased spaces were occupied between 2:00PM and 5:00PM on Saturday. During the evening count periods, an average of 78 percent of leased spaces were occupied.
- **Dedicated guest parking is utilized on Saturday.** The two designated guest parking spaces at McGovern House were occupied during the Saturday count period; the guest parking spaces were not occupied during the weekday count period.
- **On-street parking is available.** A summary of observations for the on-street parking along the frontage of the surveyed comparable developments is provided on the following page.
 - Maple + Main: The on-street spaces on Maple Avenue were generally available during the count periods. Peak demand occurred at 3:00PM on Saturday when 71 percent (5 spaces) were occupied. During the weekday and Saturday evening counts, the on-street spaces on Maple Avenue were vacant. The parking spaces along the property frontage on Main Street were also vacant during the evening count periods.
 - McGovern House: Guest parking could not be distinguished from public parking along McGovern Street. Generally, the on-street spaces on McGovern Street were 80 to 90 percent occupied.
 - Residences of Wilmette: Approximately 67 percent (2 spaces) of the on-street spaces on Green Bay Road were occupied during Saturday afternoon; the spaces were vacant during the weekday and Saturday evening hours with the exception of temporary parking for delivery vehicles.

Based on the data collected at the comparable developments, the parking supply provided for each site (Table 4) meets resident parking demand. For each development, resident parking is assigned and managed through the lease agreement; therefore, spillover resident parking is not anticipated.

Summary

A total of 66 spaces are proposed for the residential component of the mixed-use development. This includes 57 spaces assigned to residents and 9 spaces available for guests (at Main Street Promenade East). The resident parking supply includes one space for the one-bedroom units, and two spaces for the two-bedroom units. Parking for the first-floor retail use is eligible for the City's parking fee-in-lieu formula. While the residential parking supply reflects a reduction from the Municipal Code requirements, it is in keeping with the nature of the development and surrounding built environment and is expected to meet parking demand. A summary of the unique characteristics influencing parking demand for the proposed residential use is summarized below.

- **Mobility Options** – The development is in close proximity to a variety of amenities in downtown Naperville. In addition, the location provides access to an established pedestrian and bicycle network, Naperville Metra Station and Pace Suburban Bus, and alternative transportation options such as Uber/Lyft, Naperville Trolley, and Tuk Tuk Naperville. The location offers increased mobility options which is expected to influence vehicle ownership.
- **Demographics** – Based on U.S. Census data, renter-occupied households in downtown Naperville and the surrounding area generally have access to fewer vehicles than owner-occupied households. Therefore, parking demand for the proposed rental units is likely less than other residential uses. Furthermore, the proposed residential use would be designed and marketed to meet the needs of active adults. Based on the anticipated demographic profile, the units are expected to be generally occupied by single- or two-person households, and residents may own fewer vehicles than a traditional suburban residential development.
- **Unit Mix** – The proposed residential use includes a mix of one-bedroom and two-bedroom units. Approximately 92 percent of the units are one-bedroom, a portion of which may be occupied single-person households. Approximately 8 percent of the units provide two-bedrooms, a portion of which may also be occupied by single-person households. Parking demand for single-person households is likely less than the Municipal Code-required ratio of two spaces per unit.

The Municipal Code requirement of 2.25 spaces per unit does not reflect these unique conditions. While the Municipal Code acknowledges the characteristics of downtown commercial uses through the use of the CIM parking ratio, adjustments to the parking requirements for downtown residential uses are not provided. Section 6-9-3.8 of the Municipal Code acknowledges reductions to the parking requirements may be considered based on the unique characteristics of the development and shared mobility trends.

The proposed total parking supply is equal to 1.40 spaces per unit or 1.29 spaces per bedroom. The resident parking supply (excluding guest parking spaces) is equal to 1.21 spaces per unit or 1.12 spaces per bedroom. The total parking supply exceeds the average parking ratios for spaces per unit for comparable developments in other suburban downtowns. Based on parking occupancy counts, the parking supply provided at each development meets resident demand. For each development, resident parking is assigned and managed through the lease agreement; and therefore, the number of vehicles onsite is restricted. The proposed parking supply would be managed in a similar manner with assigned parking spaces designated through lease agreements.

Additionally, use of any of the designated guest parking spaces would require a temporary pass from the leasing office in order to manage occupancy of these spaces. The proposed parking supply, combined with the management plan, is expected to be sufficient to meet resident demand and spillover resident parking is not anticipated. Further, the proposed designated guest parking supply exceeds guest parking provided for comparable developments. Spillover to downtown public parking facilities is not anticipated.