



City of Naperville

400 S. Eagle Street
Naperville, IL 60540
<http://www.naperville.il.us/>

Meeting Minutes

Historic Preservation Commission

Thursday, January 23, 2025

7:00 PM

Meeting Room B

TO PROVIDE LIVE PUBLIC COMMENT, TESTIMONY, OR TO CROSS-EXAMINE WITNESSES DURING THE MEETING: To address the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) in-person during the meeting in the Council Chambers, members of the public will be called on during the meeting by the Chairman.

TO SUBMIT WRITTEN COMMENTS OR MATERIALS:

1. You may submit written comments to planning@naperville.il.us in advance of the meeting. (Please note, because emailed written comments are available for advance review by the HPC, they will not be read into the record during the HPC hearing). Below are the deadlines for written comments provided in advance of the meeting:
 - Written comments received by 5:00 p.m. the Thursday before the meeting, will be included in the meeting packet sent to the HPC. This meeting packet is also posted on the City's website.
 - Written comments received after 5:00 p.m. the Thursday before the meeting, through 5:00 p.m. the day before the meeting, will be emailed directly to the HPC, but will not be included in the HPC packet or posted online.
 - Written comments received after 5:00 p.m. the day before the meeting, will be added to the case file.

PUBLIC ACCOMMODATION:

Any individual who may require an accommodation to listen to or participate in the meeting should contact the Community Services Department at (630) 305-5300 as soon as possible, but no later than by 5 p.m. on the day of the meeting.

PARTICIPATION GUIDELINES:

The citizen participation guidelines are outlined in 1-5-6-6: - CITIZEN PARTICIPATION of the Naperville Municipal Code.

- **ALL VIEWPOINTS AND OPINIONS WELCOME:** All viewpoints are welcome, positive comments and constructive criticism are encouraged. Speakers must refrain from harassing or directing threats or personal attacks at Commission members, staff, other speakers or members of the public. Comments made to intentionally disrupt the meeting may be managed as necessary to maintain appropriate decorum and allow for city business to be accomplished.
- The HPC will call on you at the appropriate time during the meeting to speak. Once you are called on, you may identify yourself for the public record and address remarks to the Historic Preservation Commission as a whole. Speak clearly and try to limit remarks directly to the matter under discussion.

A. CALL TO ORDER:

B. ROLL CALL:

- Present** 9 - Paul Deffenbaugh, Patrick Kelly, Chris Santucci, James Wills, Robert Sanchez ,
Andrea Field , Jacob Sandborn, HPC Jessica Bufort, and HPC Kerry Malm
- Absent** 2 - Rick Fawell, and Patricia O'Brien

C. PUBLIC FORUM:

Philip Buchanan, Naperville Preservation, Inc., shared a letter with the members of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) thanking City officials for attending their annual meeting and shared updates from the meeting. He also shared information on Commission Assistance and Mentoring Program (CAMP) training and encouraged the members of the commission to attend.

Marilyn Schwitzer, Naperville resident, stated the duties of the HPC are to inform, educate and raise awareness and the 2024 Annual Report does not reference these goals. She says a new or updated Historical and Architectural survey would be beneficial as much has changed. Marilyn noted that Helmut Jahn's 'N' building will soon be eligible for landmarking. She criticized the Naperville Settlement and Naperville Heritage Society's lack of recognition of historic heritage and the City of Naperville's lack of funding for historic preservation, mentioning that there are several grants available for other purposes. Marilyn recommended the HPC work with staff and community partners to remedy these deficiencies. She offered revisions to the 2024 Annual Report's upcoming work including for the HPC to fulfill public education, work toward a citywide architectural survey, and research feasibility for a grant for historic preservation. Marilyn asked staff how the 2024 Annual Report was drafted.

Staff stated that the report was drafted by staff and will be brought up at this meeting for discussion. Following discussion, the HPC has an opportunity to revise the report and offer additional information.

D. OLD BUSINESS:**E. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

1. [Conduct the public hearing to consider the Certificate of Appropriateness \(COA\) for 226 N Sleight St.- COA 24-3622](#)

The petitioner, Carol Swain, gave their testimony.

Public Testimony

Phillip Buchanan, Naperville Preservation Inc., was a public speaker on the item, asking for more information about the previous renovation to the windows and if a COA was received for the work.

The petitioner responded that a COA was not received as aluminum clad wood is allowed.

Staff clarified that an Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness was approved for the windows on the 2nd floor of the primary façade with the use of aluminum clad wood material.

Chairman Santucci clarified that staff can approve certain work without HPC review.

Commissioner Questions and Deliberation

Commissioner Sanchez asked if there is a visual difference between fiberglass and aluminum clad wood, if the use of the front porch will change, and if the fiberglass material will change color over time.

The petitioner stated that there is not a visual difference or a change of use, and the proposed material does not yellow as there is no vinyl, has a lifetime finish warranty, and provides increased performance and lifespan. She stated that aluminum clad wood is more expensive.

Commissioner Sanchez asked staff whether fiberglass windows have previously been approved by the HPC and is concerned about precedent.

Staff would have to refer to the official records for that information and that it is up to the HPC if precedent is considered.

Chairman Santucci stated that the petitioner provided a response to the economic Factor for Consideration.

Chairman Santucci and Commissioner Sanchez inquired about the construction of the enclosed front porch.

The petitioner stated that the existing windows were installed at the time of the 2007 Historical and Architectural Survey and the original porch was open and enclosed at a later date.

Commissioner Deffenbaugh inquired about the proposed windows.

The petitioner clarified the existing conditions and the proposed scope of work, stating that installing double-hung rather than casement and removing the vertical mullion is a simple change.

Commissioner Bufort asked about the date the existing windows were installed.

Staff looked into this following the meeting and could not identify a specific date.

Commissioner Field clarified that the survey states that the porch was enclosed post-1943.

Commissioner Sanchez asked about market trends for windows.

The petitioner shared that there will always be a market for aluminum clad wood but there are benefits of fiberglass.

Chariman Santucci inquired about the factor for consideration regarding economic hardship.

Commissioner Sanchez clarified the meaning of economic hardship.

Commissioner Sandborn shared his perspective of hoping to work with residents and provide flexibility while upholding the purpose of the Historic Preservation Commission and Local Historic District.

The petitioner summarized the significant financial investment that the property owner is putting into the residence.

Staff confirmed that the HPC can include conditions with the official motion.

Commissioner Wills shared his perspective regarding flexibility for residents who are challenged financially.

The petitioner shared a brochure of the proposed windows.

Chairman Santucci said that the windows are visually the same as a double-hung.

Commissioner Sanchez further inquired about the fiberglass material.

The petitioner shared thoughts on the market for aluminum clad wood, fiberglass windows, and shared that the proposed windows will have a powder coat finish.

Commissioner Bufort referenced the increasing cost of materials such as aluminum.

The petitioner made closing remarks.

The public hearing was closed.

A motion was made to approve COA 24-3622, for consideration of the removal and replacement of the windows on the primary façade of the enclosed front porch of the principal structure with the use of fiberglass window material at 226 N Sleight Street

Aye: 5 - Santucci, Wills, Sandborn, HPC Bufort, and HPC Malm

Nay: 2 - Deffenbaugh, and Sanchez

Excused: 2 - Kelly, and Field

Absent: 2 - Fawell, and O'Brien

2. [Conduct the public hearing to consider the Certificate of Appropriateness \(COA\) for 106 N Columbia St.- COA 24-3631](#)

The petitioner and property owner, Anna Hozian, gave their testimony.

Public Testimony

Tim Messer, Naperville Resident, referred to fences that have been discussed before this Commission in the past, stating issues arise from solid fences that are 6-feet in height. He does not notice the existing 5-foot fence that the petitioner is requesting to replace. He asked the petitioner whether the existing landscaping would remain and asked about the style of fence being proposed.

The petitioner responded that the landscaping would remain as is. The style of the proposed fence is a solid scalloped board-on-board fence where the lowest point is 4.5 feet tall.

Commissioner Deliberation

Commissioner Deffenbaugh and Commissioner Sanchez noted that the photo of the proposed fence style included in the agenda packet does not match the petitioner description.

*The incorrect photo was uploaded to the agenda packet and has since been corrected.

Commissioner Deffenbaugh asked about the shape and detail of the top of the boards, asking whether they will have a pointed top similar to the existing fence.

The petitioner stated that it will be as close as possible to the existing.

The Commission asked staff to clarify the reason that the proposed fence is being brought before the Commission.

Staff stated that the Historic Preservation Code requires solid fences along a corner yard to receive approval of a COA subject to HPC review.

Commissioner Bufort noted the appeal of low open fences that utilize landscaping to achieve screening of the property. The petitioner was asked if they had considered landscaping to pair with an open fence.

The petitioner values the privacy of the back yard and referred to the existing landscaping in place.

The Commission inquired about the history of the existing fence.

Staff confirmed that there is not a COA on file for the fence, but the existing fence is compliant with the Naperville Municipal Code Section 6-2-12: - Fences.

Commissioner Bufort noted that only 2 corner lots in the district have fences up to 5 feet, both on Benton Ave.

The petitioner clarified that she is requesting a solid 5-foot fence and made brief closing remarks.

Commissioner Bufort shared concern about setting a precedent for solid fences corner lots in the Local Historic District.

Chairman Santucci explained the responsibility of the HPC regarding this matter.

Commissioner Deffenbaugh stated his preference for an open style fence due to the proximity to the street.

Commissioner Sandborn explained that this proposal is similar to an in-kind replacement.

The petitioner stated that there is not a lot of traffic on Franklin Ave. and there were no public comments in opposition of the request.

Commissioner Deffenbaugh shared common trends that he has noticed during public hearing requests and shared brief thoughts on previous cases, his understanding that residents of the Local Historic District have hardships that others in the City do not, but investment has to be made to the neighborhood as well as the subject property, and would like the fence to be open style.

Chairman Santucci reiterated that a fence is existing and asked Commissioner Field, the Naper Settlement representative, if she has any background knowledge on fences in the district.

Commissioner Field is open to conducting research as requested.

The petitioner made closing remarks.

The public hearing was closed.

A motion was made to approve COA 24-3631, for consideration of the removal and replacement of a solid fence abutting a corner side yard on the property at 106 N Columbia Street

Aye: 5 - Santucci, Wills, Sanchez, Sandborn, and HPC Malm

Nay: 2 - Deffenbaugh, and HPC Bufort

Excused: 2 - Kelly, and Field

Absent: 2 - Fawell, and O'Brien

F. REPORTS

1. [Approve the 2024 Historic Preservation Commission Annual Report](#)

Chairman Santucci requested that the Annual Report be revised to include the appointment of Commissioner Malm and Commissioner Bufort and to add the task of researching the feasibility of an updated or new historic and architectural survey.

Commissioner Sandborn and Commissioner Bufort requested more information on the 223 Center Street project.

Councilman Kelly stated that the request for more information on the 223 Center St. project is more appropriately discussed under new business.

Commissioner Deffenbaugh requested that the details of the report provided by staff for the 3/28/2024 HPC meeting be included in the 2024 Annual Report.

The HPC requested staff to look into the feasibility of a new or updated Architectural and Historical Survey for the Local Historic District.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wills and seconded by Commissioner Bufort approving the Historic Preservation Commission 2024 Annual Report and amending the report to add the appointment of Commissioner Malm and Commissioner Bufort to the 2024 Accomplishments, details of the 3/28/2024 report to be included in the report, and research the feasibility of an updated or new historic and architectural survey in the Local Historic District.

Absent: 2 - Fawell, and O'Brien

2. [Approve the Minutes of the October 24, 2024, Historic Preservation Commission Meeting](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Wills and seconded by Commissioner Bufort approving the minutes of the October 24, 2024, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Absent: 2 - Fawell, and O'Brien

G. NEW BUSINESS:

Commissioner Wills raised several topics and provided background information. Commissioner Wills shared that he has learned from his experience on the HPC referring to cases such as Heritage Place and the YMCA. He hopes to have more detailed discussions with members of the HPC outside of meetings to educate each other. He also discussed the possibility of creating a committee to assist with meeting preparation and operations, and to meet with developers or homeowners to discuss cases and current conditions to expand the HPCs understanding of each case, stating that this would have

been helpful in the case of 223 Center St. To improve the process of the HPC, Commissioner Wills suggested meeting with Naperville Preservation, Inc. to learn more. He also mentioned the complaints received by staff regarding 126 N Sleight St. which received a COA but came across issues shortly after - HPC should have known about asbestos. A committee could have been set up to look into that.

Chairman Santucci confirmed that staff can look into these concerns and provide guidance to the HPC what is needed form a committee.

Councilman Kelly clarified the limitations stated in the Open Meetings Act when it comes to meeting outside of regular or special meetings.

Commissioner Deffenbaugh said that there are several training opportunities and workshops shared by staff and Naperville Preservation, Inc. and referred to CAMP training mentioned in the public forum.

Chairman Santucci stated that a report on 223 Center St. is being requested at this time, including information on how the fines will be used, can be used, and what they might possibly be used for.

Councilman Kelly recommended that the current members of the Commission reach out to past commissioners for helpful discussions.

Commissioner Bufort asked when the last time the Bylaws and Procedures have been reviewed, and which department is responsible.

Staff stated that the Bylaws and procedures are drafted by the Mayor's Office along with the City Manager's Office.

Councilman Kelly notified the Commission that a general overview of the Bylaws and procedures has been conducted by the Mayor's Office along with the City Manager's Office.

Commissioner Wills suggested a special session in March regardless if there is a COA scheduled.

The HPC agreed that it would be beneficial to have an open session or working session where the public can ask the commission questions and share their comments and concerns.

Commissioner Wills asked about the use of the fine collected from the 223 Center St.

Councilman Kelly informed the HPC of the typical budget process regarding the fine.

A motion was made by Commissioner Malm and seconded by Commissioner Bufort approving the following items to be added to an upcoming agenda for

official Commission discussion and staff to investigate:

1. Detail the process and requirements to establish a committee with the potential committee responsible for researching the feasibility of a new or updated historic and architectural survey and advocating for the survey to be conducted
2. Provide a report on the 223 Center St. project including information on the use of funds from the citation for illegal demolition and lessons learned
3. Scheduling an agenda item for public discussion or working session at the regularly scheduled March HPC meeting. If no COA has been submitted, a meeting will be held in March for public open session regardless.
4. Report on potential training opportunities.

H. ADJOURNMENT:

A motion was made by Commissioner Deffenbaugh and seconded by Commissioner Sanchez to adjourn the January 23, 2025 Historic Preservation Commission meeting at 7:36pm