

The following Findings of Fact and response to the Factors of Consideration for the COA 20-3281 are based on a final HPC vote of 5 to 2 for the denial of the COA and are as follows:

1. The petitioner failed to apply for a Building Permit or an HPC COA for the proposed work.
2. The residence is identified as a "contributing" structure in the 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey for the Historic District and notes a significant feature as the front gable porch with brick knee walls.
3. Had the petitioner filed for such COA, the latest vote outcome would indicate that the COA would have been denied, at that time.
4. The reason for that denial is very simple- The Porch Knee Wall material was NOT proposed as a "Like for Like" Material replacement

Factors for Consideration:

5.1 Compatibility with District Character-

The replacement of materials were not "Like for Like" and are not appropriate for the Craftsman Style structure, goes for both stone and sill material replacement.

5.2 Compatibility with Architectural Style-

The stone selection is not appropriate and as stated in the Historic Building and Design Resource Manual- " encourages the retention and preservation of the original masonry materials. It is acceptable to replace the original material with brick that matches the original size and texture, as well as mortar joint profile and width."

5.3 Economic Reasonableness-

Understanding that the cost to return the structure back to the appropriate style may be large. However, because this work was done without a COA or Building Permit,

I find this Factor- Not Applicable.

5.4 Energy Conservation Effect-

N/A- negligible benefit

5.6 The City's Historic Building Design and Resource Manual-

Had this been referred to and proper applications made, none of this would now need to be addressed. Again-The stone selection is not appropriate and as stated in the Historic Building and Design Resource Manual- " encourages the retention and preservation of the original masonry materials. It is acceptable to replace the original material with brick that matches the original size and texture, as well as mortar joint profile and width."