

126 – 128 Wright Street Naperville Description of proposed work attached separate sheet

1. Application page 3 Filled out on application
2. Pictures of existing structure on attached Exhibits
 - a. Power Point 19 Page presentation attachment
 - b. Power Point 7 page Description attachment
3. Proposed Work page 4 and partial 5 on application checked as required
4. Description of proposed work – see power point attached
 - a. See description on application and power point attached
 - b. See description on application and power point attached
 - c. See description on application and power points attached
 - d. Permit plans attached and referenced on power point attached
5. Responses to each part of this section below

Factors For Consideration Of A Certificate Of Appropriateness Application:

5.1. Compatibility With District Character: The Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the compatibility of the proposed improvement with the character of the historic district in terms of scale, style, exterior features, building placement and site access, as related to the primary facade(s), in rendering a decision to grant or deny a certificate of appropriateness.

Explanation: Please describe how the proposed changes will be generally consistent with the overall character of the Historic District. With this factor, the Historic Preservation Commission seeks to confirm that the proposed changes will not conflict with the characteristics (i.e., building setback, height, materials, etc.) that are typically found in the district.

The proposed changes are compatible with the overall character of the Naperville Historic District and will not alter the building's established scale, height, placement, setbacks, site access, or relationship to the surrounding properties.

The proposed black window frames are consistent with the variety of historically appropriate exterior colors found throughout the district. Our review identified 23 homes within the Historic District that currently have black windows, demonstrating that black window frames are an established and compatible feature. The black frames will provide a restrained appearance that complements the Mansion's masonry and architectural detailing.

The proposed Moire Black roof shingles are also compatible with the range of roof colors found throughout the Historic District. The darker roof will complement the black window frames, masonry, and other exterior elements while providing continuity with the remaining buildings within Heritage Place, which use the same Moire Black roofing. This request changes only the shingle color and will not alter the roof's approved form, height, slope, massing, or architectural features.

The reconstruction of the front porch is intended to restore the porch to structural stability, the size, proportions, style, and architectural character depicted in the earliest available photographs of the Kroehler Mansion. During exploratory work, substantial deterioration was discovered,

including rotted wood, a sagging roof, sinking foundations and porch slab, and cracking masonry. Demolition and partial reconstruction have occurred, with the remaining work paused pending approval. The completed porch will incorporate historically compatible features, including brick piers, appropriate trim detailing, appropriate railings, a walkable upper surface, and flowerpots above the brick columns as shown in the early photographs.

Taken together, these improvements will preserve the Mansion's established scale and architectural identity, restore an important historic feature that will last, and create a cohesive relationship between the Mansion and the surrounding Heritage Place community. The proposed work does not introduce incompatible massing, materials, setbacks, or site elements. Instead, it reinforces the Kroehler Mansion's role as the historic and architectural centerpiece of the development while remaining consistent with the broader character of the Historic District.

5.2. Compatibility With Architectural Style: The Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the compatibility of the proposed improvement with the historic architectural style of the building or structure to be modified by the certificate of appropriateness request.

Explanation: As a structure in the Historic District, guidelines for appropriate maintenance, rehabilitation and new improvements to enhance and preserve the appearance of homes are outlined in the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual. The Manual also provides background information on each architectural style found in the Historic District. For this factor, please use the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual to identify the historic features of your home as well as if your proposed changes are "encouraged, acceptable or discouraged" in the manual. Please also reference the 2008 Architectural Survey (<https://www.naperville.il.us/about-naperville/historic-district/>) and

The 2008 Architectural and Historical Survey identifies the P.E. Kroehler House at 126 N. Wright Street as a circa-1915 Craftsman-style residence and rates it as a significant structure within the Historic District.

The three proposed changes are compatible with the building's Craftsman architecture and are intended to preserve or reestablish its character-defining features.

Black windows: The request is limited to changing the approved window-frame color from white to black. Black frames provide a subdued appearance that complements the building's brick exterior and allows the window openings to visually recede rather than compete with the Mansion's masonry and architectural detailing. The request does not remove or change any additional significant feature identified in the 2008 survey. Because the proposed color is compatible with the building's materials and overall Craftsman character, we believe this change meets the Manual's intent for an acceptable rehabilitation treatment.

Moire Black roof: The 2008 survey identifies the Mansion's existing roof material as asphalt shingles. The proposed Moire Black shingles maintain that same material and do not alter the side-gable roof, shed dormers, roof slope, massing or overhangs identified by the survey. Only the shingle color is being changed from the previously approved Weathered Wood to Moire Black. The darker, uniform color complements the brick exterior, black window frames, and roofing used throughout Heritage Place without changing the historic roof form. Because the

historic roof configuration and identified architectural features will remain intact, this request is considered an acceptable treatment under the Manual.

Front porch reconstruction: The 2008 survey specifically identifies the wraparound porch with square brick piers as a significant feature of the Kroehler House. During exploratory work, extensive deterioration was discovered, including rotted framing, a sagging roof, sinking foundation piers and porch slab, along with cracking masonry. Due to these structural conditions, the deteriorated porch was removed and partial reconstruction was undertaken. The remaining work has been paused pending Commission approval.

The proposed work will not permanently remove the porch or replace it with a different design. Instead, the porch will be reconstructed using the earliest available historic photographs as documentation so that its original dimensions, proportions and architectural character can be restored. The completed work will include square brick piers, historically compatible railings and trim, a structurally supported lower and upper walking surface, porcelain concrete toned surface, and flowerpots above the brick columns as depicted in the early photographs. Reconstructing a deteriorated character-defining feature from reliable photographic documentation is consistent with the preservation objectives of the Manual and should be considered an acceptable, and in its restoration intent an encouraged, treatment.

Although the porch itself is listed as a significant feature and was removed because of its deteriorated structural condition, it is not being eliminated from the building. It is being reconstructed to restore its documented earlier appearance.

Taken together, the proposed improvements maintain the defining elements of the Kroehler Mansion's Craftsman architecture.

5.3. Economic Reasonableness: The Commission and the Zoning Administrator shall consider the economic reasonableness of any recommended changes determined to be necessary to bring the application into conformity with the character of the historic district.

As explained in Section 5.2, we believe the proposed black windows, Moire Black roof shingles, and historically documented porch reconstruction qualify as acceptable or encouraged treatments under the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual. Therefore, an economic justification should not be required.

However, if any portion of the request—particularly the demolition of the deteriorated porch—is considered discouraged, approval of the proposed reconstruction represents the most economically reasonable solution while also achieving the City's preservation objectives.

The original porch contained substantial structural deterioration, including rotted framing, a sagging roof, sinking foundation piers, a sinking concrete slab, and cracking masonry. Retaining or repairing those failed components was not a practical long-term solution. A new foundation and concrete slab have now been installed, and the porch has been reframed to restore its original dimensions and current required structural capacity on both lower and upper surfaces. Requiring

removal or substantial alteration of this completed work would result in significant additional demolition, labor, material costs and construction waste without providing a corresponding historic preservation benefit.

The proposed porch will not be replaced with a modern or incompatible design. It will be completed to replicate the original porch shown in early photographs of the Kroehler Mansion, including its proportions, brick piers, railings, trim details, lower and upper walking surfaces, and flowerpots above the proper height brick columns. Approval therefore allows the completed structural investment to be retained while restoring the historically appropriate appearance of this architectural feature.

Approval of the three items is therefore the most economically reasonable outcome. It avoids unnecessary demolition and replacement costs while allowing the Kroehler Mansion to be completed in a manner that is structurally sound, historically compatible, and consistent with the architectural character of Heritage Place and the Historic District.

5.4. Energy Conservation Effect: In making its determinations, the Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the effect that any recommended changes may have on energy conservation.

The renovated Kroehler Mansion will be constructed consistent with current energy conservation codes, utilizing less natural resources than the current buildings require. The new roof color, window color and porch that are proposed by the Applicant are critical to meeting these standards.

5.6. The City's Historic Building Design and Resource Manual may be used as a resource in consideration of the above.

The applicable portions of the Manual address windows, roofs, porches, replacement materials, and the preservation of character-defining architectural features.

- Black windows – Acceptable: The color change is compatible with the Mansion's Craftsman architecture.
- Moire Black roof – Acceptable: The asphalt-shingle material only the shingle color is revised.
- Porch reconstruction – Acceptable/Encouraged: The deteriorated porch is being reconstructed using historic photographs to restore its original dimensions, proportions, brick piers, railings, and architectural detailing.

The proposed work preserves and restores the Mansion's character-defining features and is consistent with the Manual's acceptable and encouraged rehabilitation practices.

6. None