

Factors for Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness Application:

5.1. Compatibility With District Character: The Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the compatibility of the proposed improvement with the character of the historic district in terms of scale, style, exterior features, building placement and site access, as related to the primary facade(s), in rendering a decision to grant or deny a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Analysis: The City of Naperville has issued a certificate of appropriateness to authorize demolition of all structures on the Property. Absent approval of Applicants plan, which is centered around renovation of the Kroehler Mansion, all of the structures may legally be demolished and the Property may be redeveloped as a matter of right with 20 new single-family structures.

Applicant believes that the proposed plan for Heritage Place strikes an appropriate balance between preservation efforts consistent with the intent of the City's historic district and current redevelopment that is consistent with market trends and meets the needs of the community for a more diverse housing stock. While the proposed rowhomes take a different form than the single family and duplex structures that predominate the historic district, so too does the Kroehler Mansion. The Kroehler Mansion would not fit well within other blocks of the historic district. It is the unique size and scale of the Kroehler Mansion, and the opportunity to develop an entire city block, that creates the opportunity to introduce 3-story rowhomes to the historic district. The scale of the rowhomes appropriately relate to the renovated 3-unit Kroehler Mansion that will stand as the focal point of Heritage Place.

The proposed rowhomes will consist of a mix of 2, 3, 4 and 6 unit buildings. Applicant proposes 5 different dwelling units facades which will be incorporated in different configurations for each building. The variation in building configuration is intended to avoid monotony and address the overall scale of the buildings. Focus is given to the two buildings immediately north/south of the park site which will feature a stepped-down roof line with an open gable and a side-load entrance with a covered porch that incorporates a hip roof. The form and primary architectural features of these two buildings will follow the Kroehler Mansion and create a unique setting around the new dedicated public park space.

All of the proposed rowhome buildings will be four-sided brick buildings with a stone water table, clear nods to the character of the Kroehler Mansion. While the Kroehler Mansion has a simple façade with very little ornamentation, the proposed rowhome buildings incorporate additional ornamentation with cast stone details intended to create architectural interest. Dormers are incorporated into the primary roof line to incorporate one of the most recognizable architectural features of the Kroehler Mansion. Vertical gutters, horizontal articulation, and changes in roof lines will identify breaks between the units and help address the visual massing of the buildings in a manner that clearly relates to the Kroehler Mansion. The third story windows are slightly smaller and the roof line is brought down to address the height of the building.

Wood or hardy type siding material will be used on architectural features such as dormers and bay windows. All of the units will feature one of three different covered front entry designs, each of which is inspired by the renovation of the Kroehler Mansion and front porches on other brick homes surrounding the Property. One covered entrance design will be constructed with wood pillars and incorporate brackets or “denitl” details and will follow the form of the historic north entrance to the Kroehler Mansion. One covered entrance design will incorporate brick pillars and limestone caps, again following the form of the front porch of the Kroehler Mansion and other surrounding homes. At block corners, the third covered entrance design will feature a wrap-around front porch with brick pillars and limestone caps, again following the form of the Kroehler Mansion. The proposed rowhome dwellings are not intended to mimic the Kroehler Mansion, but to incorporate important architectural details that provide a clear nod to the historical design while creating modern space with light and air that meets the discerning criteria of target buyers.

5.2. Compatibility With Architectural Style: The Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the compatibility of the proposed improvement with the historic architectural style of the building or structure to be modified by the Certificate of Appropriateness request.

Analysis: The architectural style of the Kroehler Mansion is designated as craftsman in City documentation. Applicant has utilized that designation in the selection and design of various architectural components. In particular, Applicant has selected windows and doors with typical craftsman style detailing for both the renovation of the Kroehler Mansion and for the proposed rowhome buildings.

5.3. Economic Reasonableness: The Commission and the Zoning Administrator shall consider the economic reasonableness of any recommended changes determined to be necessary to bring the application into conformity with the character of the historic district.

Analysis: The City previously approved plans for demolition of all structures located on the Property, including the Kroehler Mansion, finding preservation would create an undue burden on Little Friends and that redevelopment of the Property was the highest and best use. Applicant maintains the right to demolish pursuant to City approvals in the event that renovation of the Kroehler Mansion cannot be accomplished in an economically reasonable fashion and the use Kroehler Mansion converted to a modern and productive use consistent with market trends. As detailed in documentation previously provided by Little Friends, the sales history in the Historic District simply does not support a multi-million dollar renovation on the scale of the Kroehler Mansion. The renovation and adaptive use proposed by Applicant is a reasonable means of bridging the gap between total demolition of existing improvements and strict application of preservation requirements.

As part of the renovation effort, Petitioner seeks to upgrade the Kroehler Mansion consistent with current HVAC, plumbing, electric and energy conservation standards. By way of example, Petitioner simply cannot sell new row home units from the \$800,000's with window air conditioning units. These units are extraordinarily inefficient by modern standards and are inconsistent with the character and quality of development being proposed. In a similar vein, Petitioner will be replacing the existing windows with a modern window systems which meet current energy efficiency requirements. While this is important for the modern function of the interior of the dwelling units, it will also allow Petitioner to also address aesthetic issues. First and foremost, with new windows the Kroehler Mansion will get a uniform treatment around the building. The existing windows include a variety of different formats that have been modified throughout the years. In addition, with the demolition of the building additions to the original Kroehler Mansion, Petitioner will need to add new window opening that were removed during the construction of those building additions. To maintain the integrity of the Kroehler Mansion, Petitioner proposes new window systems that match the structure and appearance of the existing window systems. While the new windows will not include the leaded glass that is original to the home, Petitioner intends to custom build an interior shutter system to apply the leaded glass and maintain that original appearance from the exterior. At a minimum, Petitioner is committed to installing the shutter system across the front façade of the Kroehler Mansion. Petitioner anticipates additional applications, but believes that the front elevation is the critical element that must be maintained. Petitioner believes that this is an economically reasonable solution that maintains the integrity of the building while positioning it as modern housing for the next century.

5.4. Energy Conservation Effect: In making its determinations, the Commission and Zoning Administrator shall consider the effect that any recommended changes may have on energy conservation.

Analysis: The renovated Kroehler Mansion and the proposed rowhome buildings will be constructed consistent with current energy conservation codes, utilizing less natural resources than the current buildings require. The new roof, window and door systems that are proposed by the Applicant are critical to meeting these standards.

5.6. The City's Historic Building Design and Resource Manual may be used as a resource in consideration of the above.

Analysis: Applicant has considered provisions of the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual and the City's designation of the Kroehler Mansion as a "Craftsman" style home in preparation of both the Preservation Plan and the elevations for the proposed rowhome buildings. Applicant believes that the proposed plans appropriately consider context and adaptive reuse of the Kroehler Mansion to create a unique

redevelopment plan where demolition of all structures previously seemed a foregone conclusion.