



Meeting Minutes

Historic Preservation Commission

Thursday, August 27, 2020

7:00 PM

Held on Zoom due to COVID-19

Special Meeting

CITY OF NAPERVILLE PUBLIC MEETINGS UPDATE:

On Friday, June 12, 2020, an amendment to the Open Meetings Act was signed into law. This new law replaces the gubernatorial executive order concerning the Open Meetings Act and allows public bodies to temporarily conduct meetings remotely during a state of emergency, subject to certain requirements, including a determination by the head of the public body that an in-person meeting is not practical or prudent.

On Tuesday, June 16, 2020, Mayor Chirico issued an executive order determining that in-person meetings of the City Council and the City's boards and commissions are not currently practical or prudent due to the Covid-19 pandemic. Accordingly, the Historic Preservation Commission meeting scheduled for August 19, 2020 will be conducted remotely. The means by which the public may watch, listen, and/or participate in the meeting are described below.

TO JOIN A MEETING:

The meeting will be conducted using the Zoom Video Conferencing. You do not need to download any software or create an account to participate.

To login on your computer or iPad:

Click the link to join the webinar, the password is provided on this agenda. Once connected, if you choose to speak, click the "Raise Hand" button at the bottom of Zoom screen and wait for the Chairman to recognize you. When it is your turn to speak, you will be unmuted. There will be a few second delay after you are unmuted until your mic will be live. Please identify yourself for the public record and speak clearly.

To login on your phone:

For iPhones, use the iPhone one-tap number provided on this agenda.

For telephones, dial one of the numbers provided and join the meeting by using meeting ID and password provided on this agenda.

Once connected to the meeting, press *9 to "raise your hand" and wait for the Chairman to recognize you. When it is your turn to speak, you will be unmuted. There will be a few second delay after you are unmuted until your mic will be live. Please identify yourself for the public record and speak clearly.

PARTICIPATION GUIDELINES:

All viewpoints are welcome. Positive comments and constructive criticism are encouraged. Speakers must refrain from harassing or directing threats or personal attacks at board members, staff, other speakers or members of the public. Comments made to intentionally disrupt the meeting may be managed as necessary to maintain appropriate decorum and allow for city business to be accomplished.

PUBLIC ACCOMMODATION:

Any individual who may require an accommodation to participate in the meeting or to view materials for the Historic Preservation Commission meeting, should contact the City Clerk at (630) 305-5300 by Wednesday, August 26, 2020.

ZOOM MEETING LOG IN:

Please click the link below to join the webinar:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/84071838051?pwd=dnFNYIMxT3FBRDg1OUd2emRkd096dz09>

Passcode: 773433

Or iPhone one-tap :

US: +13126266799,,84071838051#,,,,,0#,,773433# or
+16465588656,,84071838051#,,,,,0#,,773433#

Or Telephone:

Dial(for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):

US: +1 312 626 6799 or +1 646 558 8656 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1
346 248 7799 or +1 669 900 9128

Webinar ID: 840 7183 8051

Passcode: 773433

International numbers available: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/84071838051?pwd=dnFNYIMxT3FBRDg1OUd2emRkd096dz09>

A. CALL TO ORDER:**B. ROLL CALL:**

Present: Doyle, Eveslage, Franczyk, Fessler, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Ory,
Chairman Peterson, Urda, Councilman Kelly (non-voting), and Howard (non-voting)
Absent: None

C. PUBLIC FORUM:

There was not any discussion for the public forum.

D. OLD BUSINESS:**E. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

1. Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Request for Heritage Place development (140/126 North Wright Street and 619 E. Franklin Avenue) - COA 20-2321

(Item 1 of 3)

Russell Whitaker, attorney for RAM West Capital, presented the proposal for the petitioner. Whitaker presented the proposal in two main sections: the mansion preservation efforts and the rowhome development. The preservation presentation described how the mansion would be separated into three units and the overall exterior façade changes to the mansion. The new aspects of the site were described through the proposed elevations of the new homes and aspects of the site including, open space, parking, access and landscaping.

Public Testimony:

Marilyn Schweitzer, Naperville resident, requested denial of the COA and that the HPC not recommend approval of the requested conditional use and variances. Schweitzer spoke of concerns about the similarity of the new buildings, height, bulking and landscaping detailed in the proposal.

Tim Messer, spoke on behalf of the East Central Homeowners Organization (ECHO). Messer spoke in support of the protection within ECHO's boundaries, the exterior façade changes on the mansion, the proposed open space, and the proposed façades of the townhome units. Messer further noted that ECHO does not support the conditional use and variances associated with the proposal. Messer noted a survey that was conducted within the ECHO's boundaries and feedback indicated concerns with the proposal from residents. Messer expressed that if the development is not economically viable, then the demolition of the Kroehler mansion may be the better long term solution from ECHO's perspective.

Carol Schmidt, adjacent property owner to the subject property, agreed with ECHO's position and emphasized concern with the setback variance. Carol also spoke on behalf of neighbor, Kathy Taft, who concurs with ECHO's position.

Becky Simon, spoke on behalf of Naperville Preservation Inc., and was concerned with the proposal's density, height, setbacks and massing of the new buildings in relation to the existing neighborhood.

Signe Gleeson spoke in opposition of the variances requested as the proposed development is an assault on the neighborhood. Gleeson detailed concerns about the track record of the developer and emphasized the development should not be exempt from the

Historic District guidelines.

Susan Fitch spoke in support of ECHO's position with massing and density concerns.

Alberto Rodriguez, Naperville resident, spoke in support of ECHO's position.

Tom Ryan, architect, former HPC member and Naperville resident, noted the current proposal is not aligned with the Historic Building Design and Resource Manual. Ryan showed a slide with a rendering created by Ryan and Naperville Preservation comparing the massing of single family homes to the townhome proposal. Ryan expressed opposition to the granting of a COA to the current proposal.

Chris Forthaus, Naperville resident, spoke in support of ECHO's position.

Greg Remec, supports ECHO's position and described concern with the proposed density, height and setbacks.

Jim Haselhorst spoke about concerns with the mansion proposal, as it did not describe the changes on all sides of the structure, carriage porch, restoration of the western porch entrance, and restoration of the original historic openings and windows. Haselhorst requested the HPC not approve the restoration and preservation plan.

Ross Berkley, Naperville resident, spoke adding that Berkley is not a member of ECHO, nor does Berkley agree with all of ECHO's position. Berkley spoke in support of the recent changes made to the plan in response to feedback from the neighborhood. Berkley explained that if the setback variance of the interior parking lots were reduced or removed, Berkley would be in support. Berkley requested a reduction in the density and spoke on concerns with the height variance and the potential for an unfinished project due to financing.

Erik Haugsnes, Naperville resident, spoke in support of ECHO's position noting that there are few buildings in the surrounding area that do not meet the setback and height requirements.

Karena Chapman, Naperville resident, spoke in support of ECHO's position and added that the developer of the subject property should be upheld to the same requirements as imposed on all other properties in the Historic District.

Karen Solomon, Historic District resident, spoke on concerns with the similarity between each of the proposed building design, parking, traffic, flooding in the alley between Wright Street and Sleight Street, and the visual difference of the proposed buildings without foliage during the fall and winter months.

Mary Anne Yep, Naperville Resident, spoke about personal experiences with the HPC meetings, those that live within the Historic District and discrepancies with DJK builders. Yep asked if the current builder is the right person to develop this property.

Karl Rahder, Naperville resident, spoke in opposition to the proposed development and any high density on the site.

Julie Garrison, Naperville homeowner, spoke on concerns of the development's balance sheet and the design of the development, which does not align with the neighborhood. Garrison asked the development to be conducted responsibly and respectfully. Garrison lastly asked the HPC to vote against the development as proposed.

Brad Kitchner, Naperville resident, spoke on another option for the site to be developed with less density without keeping the mansion. Kitchner agreed with prior comments about the traffic shifting to nights and weekends. Kitchner noted that the street around the development is currently seen as quiet as he is away while the school is in session.

Doug States spoke about affordable housing that could be incorporated into the subject property in opposition to the idea. States noted he believed North Central would have been the best property owner because they maintain their property.

Marilyn Schweitzer spoke in disagreement of the prior point that the parkway trees will prevent the block from looking massive.

Wright King spoke in agreement with ECHO's position and expressed additional concerns over the proposed density of the project relative to the density when the homes in the neighborhood were built.

Ross Berkley expressed that the person that began the "save the mansion" group no longer lives in the district. Berkley also noted that the financial stability of the neighborhood and overall benefit of the neighborhood should be considered if the land were to be left vacant.

Julie Garrison noted that ECHO is not a part of “save the mansion” group and the group began with several neighbors.

Mary Anne Yep spoke about Julie Garrison’s helpfulness in communicating with the people in the neighborhood do not use the internet.

David Hayward, Naperville resident, spoke positively about the work conducted by Julie Garrison for the community. Hayward noted concern with the density of the proposal.

Vice Chair Jacks concluded public comment and asked for any questions from the HPC for the petitioner or members of the public to be raised.

Commissioner Franczyk asked if the mansion units will be designed individually, each unit will be on individual parcels, and the three units could be consolidated into one unit by an individual.

Russell Whitaker, attorney for the petitioner, clarified that the units would be designed individually and subdivided into separate parcels. Whitaker also explained that as with any residential configuration someone could combine all units in the mansion.

Vice Chair Jacks noted that one person was somewhat in support and all other comments were opposed. Vice Chair Jacks asked the petitioner if they reached out for input from the neighbors.

Russell Whitaker responded noting that there has been 18 to 20 months of discussions with the neighborhood and City Council. Whitaker noted that there has not been compromise from the public, when the development has made compromises such as dedicating land to the park and restoring the mansion.

Vice Chair Jacks asked for any other Commissioner comments before closing remarks. Vice Chair Jacks noted that staff is in support of what will be voted on this evening.

Russell Whitaker provided closing remarks spoke about the good dialogue with residents including agreements and disagreements for the developer and residents. Whitaker noted the existing townhome developments in Naperville that are adjacent to single family homes and spoke on the belief that the proposed development will have a positive impact on the neighborhood describing the sale price of the townhomes.

Kathleen Russell, Community Planner, noted that there was one member of the public with their hand raised and asked if Vice Chair Jacks would like to accept the comment.

Vice Chair Jacks noted his opinion was that the public comment is closed.

Commissioner Urda shared a visual that was submitted to the HPC by Marilyn Schweitzer that showed the proposed project's density compared to the surrounding existing homes and the massing of the proposed rowhomes in relation to a single family home concept. Commissioner Urda stated he would be voting no and asked other HPC members to also vote no.

Commissioner Ory noted both parties had compelling arguments and asked if compromises could be reached changing the façade of the development and type of housing to single family. Commissioner Ory spoke in support of the restoration improvements to the mansion, the playground and rose garden. Ory asked for additional compromises if the proposal moves forward including variation in the height and setbacks of the townhomes.

Commissioner Franczyk agreed with Commissioner Ory's proposal for additional compromises which Franczyk noted could include a decrease in density, increased setbacks and variety in the elevations of the rowhomes. Commissioner Franczyk expressed that the more detail could be put into the preservation of the mansion, similar to the amount of detail put into the townhomes. Commissioner Franczyk asked what would stop the developer from beginning construction and demolishing the mansion which leaves the Historic District with an odd development. Commissioner Franczyk spoke in opposition for leveraging the preservation of the mansion for a higher density. Commissioner Franczyk also asked about the incentive agreement.

Commissioner Urda noted the non-demolition covenant is between Naperville and Little Friends. Commissioner Urda spoke in concern with the guiding of the covenant.

Councilmember Kelly spoke on the process of the covenant and noted that the COA must be forfeited and a deed and covenant must be recorded against any future demolition of the mansion, then would Naperville give Little Friends \$450,000. Councilmember Kelly explained the intent of the and where the funds may be drawn from.

Commissioner Franczyk asked how many homes the amount was calculated from.

Councilmember Kelly explained the calculation was based on 20 years of 20 homes and noted the amount takes into account the highest offer with the mansion and without the mansion.

Kathleen Russell, Community Planner, noted that because new evidence was brought up in the discussion, staff was advised to permit Russell Whitaker an opportunity to provide additional comment.

Vice Chair Jacks asked for clarification on what the new evidence was.

Kathleen Russell, Community Planner, noted that the visuals shared by Commissioner Urda may be considered new evidence.

Commissioner Urda noted the information was provided under additional information.

Russell Whitaker refrained from additional comment.

Gabrielle Mattingly, Community Planner, noted that the incentive discussion is not relevant to the HPC discussion.

Vice Chair Jacks agreed with Mattingly's comment.

Commissioner Urda stated that the community's thoughts on the proposal are clear and that their message should be reflected in the HPC's no vote.

Commissioner Garrison spoke in agreement of a compromise and noted the demolition of the mansion and development of single family homes as a potential new compromise.

Commissioner Urda noted that the choice is yes or no on tonight's agenda item.

2. Provide a recommendation on the conditional use for 47 townhomes, variances to the lot area requirements, front yard setback requirements and a height variance for the property located at 140/126 North Wright Street and 619 E. Franklin Avenue (Heritage Place) - PZC 20-1-061 (Item 2 of 3)

A motion was made by Commissioner Urda and seconded by Commissioner

Fessler to recommend approval of PZC 20-1-061, a conditional use for 47 townhomes, a variance to the lot area requirement, a variance to the front yard setback requirement and a height variance for the property located at 140/126 North Wright Street and 619 E. Franklin Avenue.

Aye: Fessler and Ory

Nays: Doyle, Eveslage, Franczyk, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks and Urda

- 3. Consider the proposed exterior façade changes to the Kroehler Mansion and the proposed exterior façade of the townhome unit buildings for the property located at 140/126 North Wright Street and 619 E. Franklin Avenue (Heritage Place) - COA 20-2321 (Item 3 of 3)

A motion was made by Commissioner Fessler and seconded by Commissioner Urda to approve COA 20-2321, for exterior façade changes to the Kroehler Mansion and the proposed exterior façade of the townhome unit buildings for the property located at 140/126 North Wright Street and 619 E. Franklin Avenue.

Aye: Garrison, Fessler and Ory

Nays: Doyle, Eveslage, Franczyk, Vice Chair Jacks and Urda

F. REPORTS

- 1. Approve the minutes of the June 25, 2020, Historic Preservation Commission meeting

A motion was made by Commissioner Urda seconded by Commissioner Eveslage to approve the meeting minutes of the June 25, 2020, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Aye: Doyle, Eveslage, Franczyk, Fessler, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Ory, Chairman Peterson, and Urda

Nays: None

G. NEW BUSINESS:

- 1. Conduct the discussion requested by the Historic Preservation Commission at the June 25, 2020, meeting concerning the transition away from staff recommendations and towards applicants justifying their proposal against the factors of consideration

Chairman Peterson postponed the discussion due to the late hour.

H. ADJOURNMENT:

A motion was made by Commissioner Garrison, seconded by Commissioner Urda to adjourn the August 27, 2020, Historic Preservation Commission meeting at 10:20 pm.

Aye: Doyle, Eveslage, Franczyk, Fessler, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Ory, Chairman Peterson, and Urda

Nays: None