



Meeting Minutes

Historic Preservation Commission

Thursday, October 26, 2023

7:00 PM

Meeting Room B

TO PROVIDE LIVE PUBLIC COMMENT, TESTIMONY, OR TO CROSS-EXAMINE WITNESSES DURING THE MEETING: To address the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) in-person during the meeting in Meeting Room B, members of the public will be called on during the meeting by the Chairman.

TO SUBMIT WRITTEN COMMENTS OR MATERIALS:

1. You may submit written comments to planning@naperville.il.us in advance of the meeting. (Please note, because emailed written comments are available for advance review by the HPC, they will not be read into the record during the HPC hearing). Below are the deadlines for written comments provided in advance of the meeting:

- Written comments received by 5:00 p.m. the Thursday before the meeting, will be included in the meeting packet sent to the HPC. This meeting packet is also posted on the City's website.
- Written comments received after 5:00 p.m. the Thursday before the meeting, through 5:00 p.m. the day before the meeting, will be emailed directly to the HPC, but will not be included in the HPC packet or posted online.
- Written comments received after 5:00 p.m. the day before the meeting, will be added to the case file.

PUBLIC ACCOMMODATION:

Any individual who may require an accommodation to listen to or participate in the meeting should contact the Community Services Department at (630) 305-5300 as soon as possible, but no later than by 5 p.m. on the day of the meeting.

PARTICIPATION GUIDELINES:

The citizen participation guidelines are outlined in 1-5-6-6: - CITIZEN PARTICIPATION of the Naperville Municipal Code.

- ALL VIEWPOINTS AND OPINIONS WELCOME: All viewpoints are welcome, positive comments and constructive criticism are encouraged. Speakers must refrain from harassing or directing threats or personal attacks at Commission members, staff, other speakers or members of the public. Comments made to intentionally disrupt the meeting may be managed as necessary to maintain appropriate decorum and allow for city business to be accomplished.
- The HPC will call on you at the appropriate time during the meeting to speak. Once you are called on, you may identify yourself for the public record and address remarks to the Historic Preservation Commission as a whole. Speak clearly and try to limit remarks directly to the matter under discussion.

A. CALL TO ORDER:

B. ROLL CALL:

Present: Brown, Deffenbaugh, Fawell, O'Brien, Vice Chairwoman Ory, Robbins, Santucci, Wills, Sack (non-voting)
Absent: Garrison, Councilman Kelly (non-voting)

C. PUBLIC FORUM:

Becky Simon, Naperville Preservation, showed appreciation for the credentials of the new commissioners. Simon encouraged the HPC members to use the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions as a resource in their work.

D. OLD BUSINESS:**E. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS****1. [Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness \(COA\) for 223 Center Street - COA 23-3770](#)**

The petitioner gave their testimony.

There was no public comment on this agenda item.

The Commission began deliberation, inquiring about the size of the window opening and material to be used, as well as the height of the roof. The Commission compared the proposed plans to plans that were previously approved for rehabilitation to this residence with COA 22-4462.

The petitioner explained the timeline of their involvement in the project, that the same architect who worked on the previous plans was retained, the window will use vinyl material in the same size opening, and the roof height will be raised with increased ceiling height and construction of the new roof system. The petitioner also stated their plans to rehab the home into a single-family residence.

The Commission clarified the architectural style of the home as Upright and Wing. Discussions regarding height of the roof, mentioning the roof line and the change in scale impacts the architectural character of the residence. Commissioners observed that the side gable will be raised to exceed the height of the front gable, which is significantly different from the previously approved COA for rehabilitation to this residence.

The petitioner provided insight into the scope of the work to be done, including expanding on the interior rehabilitation to be done, including raising the ceiling height of the first floor, second floor, and 2nd story windows.

The Commission discussed previous alterations done to the home and considered that the home's age suggests many of the existing features may not be original. It was clarified that the Commission's role is to maintain the architectural and historic integrity of the home, specifically the exterior and primary façade, and provide guidance, while considering the investment of time and money into rehabilitating a historic home.

The petitioner expanded on the difficulty of rehabilitating a historic home as historic buildings were not constructed to the same code as modern homes; safety hazards are present. The petitioner discussed alternatives to rehabilitating the home into a single-family residence; demolition, two-unit

residence.

Previously approved plans COA 22-4462 were displayed on the projector for viewing.

Suggestions from the Commission included showing an A to B comparison of the previously approved COA and the current proposal, providing a 3D rendering, referencing resources to maintain the Upright and Wing style, and revisiting the project with the architect and revising the plans. Discussion compared rehabilitating the home for a single-family use vs. a two-unit. The Commission addressed staff, inquiring about contingencies if petitioner would be able to follow up and submit the 3D rendering after a decision is made.

Staff Liaison Brad Iwicki advised that new evidence should not be introduced after a decision is made and suggested continuing discussion of this agenda item at a future meeting.

The Commission asked the petitioner about their plans for the home after rehabilitation is complete, to which the petitioner responded, the current owner would not occupy the home and the home will be sold as a single-family residence.

Closing remarks from the petitioner mentioned the project would likely be delayed until spring 2024 if the current COA request is denied.

A motion was made by Vice Chairwoman Ory and seconded by Commissioner Robbins to approve COA 23-3770 to allow for new openings and a change in style and material for two second-story windows, and a new roof system with a change in height and pitch and the use of asphalt shingles to 223 Center Street.

Aye: Fawell, O'Brien, Vice Chairwoman Ory, Wills

Nay: Brown, Deffenbaugh, Santucci

Commissioner Sack provided additional information to the petitioner about contacting the State of Illinois Historic Preservation Office.

2. [Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness \(COA\) for 8 S Columbia Street - COA 23-3861](#)

The petitioner gave their testimony.

Public testimony included comment from a neighbor of 8 S Columbia Street who stated their support of the addition is due to the addition not detracting from the character of the home and maintaining neighborhood character.

The Commission began deliberation, inquiring about the proposed materials of the addition and concerns that the proposal would create a false sense of historic architecture if materials were an exact match.

It was confirmed that the siding will match and the contractor who installed the existing siding will be retained to complete the work on the addition.

The petitioner was questioned about the windows on the addition; the scale of the top window, and the glass window on the first floor.

It was stated that the small second floor window is in the bathroom. The first-floor window is a leaded window to be relocated from the secondary façade where the addition will be.

In the petitioner's closing remarks, they stated their belief that the historic style

of the home is maintained and thanked the Commission for their role.

A motion was made by Commissioner Santucci and seconded by Commissioner Robbins to approve COA 23-3861 to allow for a two-story addition to a secondary façade that impacts the exterior architectural appearance of the primary façade of the principal structure and alters the roof shape and height at 8 S Columbia Street.

Aye: Brown, Deffenbaugh, Fawell, O'Brien, Vice Chairwoman Ory, Santucci, Wills
Nay: None

F. REPORTS

1. [Approve the Minutes for the September 28, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission Meeting.](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Robbins and seconded by Commissioner Santucci to approve the minutes of the September 28, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission Meeting.

Aye: Brown, Deffenbaugh, Fawell, O'Brien, Vice Chairwoman Ory, Santucci, Wills
Nay: None

G. NEW BUSINESS:

Commissioner Sack announced her retirement from the City of Naperville Historic Preservation Commission and introduced Dr. Andrea Field, Curator of History at Naper Settlement, who will be assigned to the role of representing the Naperville Heritage Society on the Historic Preservation Commission.

H. ADJOURNMENT:

A motion was made by Commissioner Robbins and seconded by Commissioner Santucci to adjourn the October 26, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission Meeting at 8:05 pm.

Aye: Brown, Deffenbaugh, Fawell, O'Brien, Vice Chairwoman Ory, Santucci, Wills
Nay: None