



Meeting Minutes

Historic Preservation Commission

Thursday, March 21, 2019

7:00 PM

Meeting Room B

A. CALL TO ORDER:

B. ROLL CALL:

Present: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Noel, Ory, Eveslage, Chairman Peterson, Urda, Howard (non-voting), Councilwoman Anderson (non-voting), Sharma (student representative), Shandilya (student representative)

Absent: Martinez, Li (student representative)

C. PUBLIC FORUM:

D. OLD BUSINESS:

E. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) request in order to remove and replace the front porch for the property located at 15 N. Columbia- COA 19-487

Tim Winter, contractor of the homeowners, gave an overview of the request stating the footprint of the porch will remain and the homeowners will be rebuilding the decking, taking out the knee wall and putting up piers, balusters and pickets.

Public Testimony:

Bob Baiyor raised concern for the proposed pickets stating the alteration is inconsistent with the original architecture.

Chairman Peterson clarified that the proposal will be balusters with a railing and columns and the pickets are located below the porch flooring. Peterson stated American Foursquare has both the low wall style and the baluster style.

Commissioner Ory stated there is also an American Foursquare style without anything type of railing or knee wall concluding the proposal stays within the American Foursquare style.

Commissioner Jacks requested information on the original style of the porch.

Chairman Peterson stated the original porch had a low knee wall.

Commissioner Urda agrees with staff and is in support of the proposal.

A motion was made by Commissioner Ory and seconded by Commissioner Doyle to approve COA #19-487 in order to remove and replace the front porch and change the porch style from a low knee wall to a railing with balusters and piers for the property located at 15 N. Columbia.

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Noel, Ory, Eveslage, Chairman Peterson, Urda

Nays: None

2. Provide a recommendation on the proposed rezoning of the properties bounded by School Street, Wright Street, Columbia Street, and Franklin Avenue to the CU Zoning District (Little Friends)- PZC 19-1-18

Commissioner Ory recused.

Kathy West, attorney for petitioner, Jim Godo and Michael Hudson, representatives of North Central College, gave a presentation on the request providing information on the history of the site and the Colleges timeline for acquisition.

Public Comment:

Eric Haugsnes questioned if the property would remain in the historic district after rezoning and asked to see drawings of the proposal. Mr. Haugsnes asked for the permitted height in the CU district.

Kathy West responded stating the college is asking for a recommendation by the HPC to rezone the property from the R2 district to the CU district. West clarified the College will submit an additional COA for any future developments. Michael Hudson stated the permitted height is a maximum of 50' in the CU district.

Bob Baiyor asked for the height of the science center.

Michael Hudson stated the science center is under 50'.

Chairman Peterson questioned when the R2 district was amended to no longer include CU uses.

Kathy West provided information on the history of the CU district stating North Central College properties were rezoned to CU once the district was established and the R2 district was amended to eliminate college/university uses.

Commissioner Urda inquired why the college felt this was the appropriate time to rezone.

Jim Godo responded stating the existence of the CU zoning would provide the college guidance for how to develop the site in the future prior to acquisition.

Commissioner Urda clarified that another COA would be submitted for the future development of the site and that public input would be very important at that time.

Kathy West, Mike Hudson, and Jim Godo stated the college understands community outreach is an important part of the process and neighborhood meetings would be scheduled for any proposed development at the site.

Wright King asked if the setbacks would change with the rezoning request. King raised concern for setbacks stating the new science center is not setback far enough and it seems out of place in the district.

Kathy West responded stating, if rezoned, the CU setbacks would be applicable.

Sandy Meyer said that many people had concerns with the science center and finds the district requirements may not be strict enough for future developments. Meyer asked if the property can be purchased and the rezoning can occur once plans are in place.

Jim Godo stated that was not part of the request and that the rezoning would provide the college with guidance on what can be done on the property.

Erik Haugsnes asked for the setbacks between the R2 and CU districts.

Staff stated a building setback of not less than 25' shall serve the boundary of the College.

Commissioner Urda asked if all the properties on the college campus are zoned CU.

Jim Godo responded yes. Mike Hudson said they are going to do everything that is stated in the North Central College Master Land Use Plan.

Pat Arthur asked why the college wishes to leave the historic district and asked if the buildings will be torn down.

Kathy West responded saying the properties will still remain in the historic district but will be rezoned to CU. Mike Hudson stated the college does not know the plan for the property.

Sandy Meyer asked what would become of the property if it was not rezoned or acquired by the college.

Jim Godo responded in the absence of rezoning, the College would not have any guidance for the property. Godo stated the College is unaware of what would happen to the property if it was not acquired.

Laura Decker asked for the height differences between the R2 and CU districts.

Staff stated the maximum height in the CU district is 4 stories not to exceed 50 feet. In the R2 district, 2 ½ stories not to exceed 35 feet.

Erik Haugsnes asked for the FAR in the CU district.

West responded there is not FAR in the CU district.

Sandy Meyer asked for the setback of the current buildings.

Mike Briggs, president and CEO of Little Friends, said the majority of the buildings are setback 25'. Mike Hudson said any proposal would be in line with the district requirements which are a minimum of 25' setback.

Pat Arthur asked if variances would be required if the zoning were to stay R2.

West stated the property cannot remain R2 because the R2 district does not allow for any college/university use.

Eric Haugsnes asked if the subject property was grandfathered in.

West stated that schools are permitted in R2.

Commissioner Eveslage asked why the college did not rezone the property in 1989.

West said the property was sold to Little Friends in 1989 and Little Friends was already using the property at that time.

Commissioner Jacks asked if staff was supporting the request and asked if Little Friends was in support of the request.

Staff said they are in support of the rezoning. Mike Briggs stated Little Friends is in support of the request.

Councilwoman Anderson raised concern for the dozens of houses that have been lost to accommodate the College and the light pollution the Science Center created. Councilwoman Anderson requested for more respect for the residents in the area and encourages residents to attend meetings and speak out.

Chairman Peterson read the permitted uses in the CU district for consideration of the Commission.

Commissioner Urda feels this is a great place for university to expand and finds it would impact the district far less.

Commissioner Noel raised concern for future increased traffic on Columbia Street if the property is to be redeveloped. Commissioner Noel stated Columbia is already very busy.

Councilwoman Anderson asked if staff can look into other college/universities

that are situated in a historic district and find out how they handle the impact.

Staff stated the North Central College Master Land Use Plan was created to reduce impact on the historic district and provide the College with guidance on any redevelopments.

Pat Arthur asked if the historic district follows state statute.

West said the district is a local historic district created by the City.

Pat Arthur asked if the HPC will be rezoning the property.

Chairman Peterson stated they HPC will be making a recommendation, the request will need to be reviewed by the Planning and Zoning Commission and the City Council.

Commissioner Garrison stated there is clear communication if any plans were proposed, a COA would be submitted.

A motion was made by Commissioner Doyle and seconded by Commissioner Urda to provide a positive recommendation on the request to rezone the properties bounded by School Street, Wright Street, Columbia Street, and Franklin Avenue to the CU Zoning District.

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Eveslage, Chairman Peterson, Urda

Nays: Noel

Recused: Ory

3. Consider the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) request to demolish the existing single family residential home and construct a new single family residential home on the property located at 26 N. Sleight- COA 19-402

Dan Kittilsen, builder for the homeowners Christopher and Mary Ann Yep, provided an overview of the proposed demolition and rebuild of the single family home at 26 N. Sleight.

Public Comment:

Carl Webber raised concern with preservation of the existing trees and believes the home should be restored regardless of cost. Mr. Webber requested the Commission give thought to the state of 32 S. Sleight.

Dan Kittilsen responded stating several trees will remain.

Mr. Yep stated while they appreciate history and nature, the property at 26 N. Sleight cannot be restored.

Bob Baiyor questioned the cost estimation that was provided by the petitioner.

Commissioner Jacks believed the cost estimation to be accurate.

Karen Soloman stated that all repairs in the historic district are pricey, but the

purpose of the historic district is about preservation, not cost. Mrs. Soloman raised concern for how the house was marketed and believes it was marketed as a teardown and not a restoration property.

Sandy Meyer believes the house has not been repaired for a long time and that all homes in the historic district should not be let go this far.

Carl Webber asked the petitioner if the square footage of the new house is larger.

Dan Kittilsen stated the footprint of the house is larger.

Susan Finch would like the Commission to look at ways to prevent deterioration of historic homes.

Commissioner Urda stated cost is part of analysis for a COA.

Doug States believes the way the house was marketed gave motivation to tear down the house and that the cost for repairs should not be considered as part of the COA request.

Commissioner Urda asked Chairman Peterson what was being proposed with the COA request.

Chairman Peterson responded stating the HPC has the ability to split up the COA to vote separately on the demolition and the proposed single family home. Peterson asked if the petitioner could provide more finalized construction drawings.

Dan Kittilsen stated this is not a preliminary design, the footprint, house, window and garage locations are all set locations.

Commissioner Jacks raised concern with losing the architectural style of the home if the house is restored.

Carl Webber asked staff if a vote on the request needed to be made tonight.

Staff responded yes.

Commissioner Garrison does not feel this is the only option and that there is a path to a better outcome. Commissioner Garrison is not in support of the demolition.

Commissioner Ory is concerned for letting the house sit longer and further deteriorate. Feels the commission should take this opportunity.

A motion was made by Commissioner Ory and seconded by Commissioner Doyle to split the vote on the COA #19-402 request, to vote separately on the proposed demolition and the proposed single family home.

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Noel, Ory, Eveslage, Chairman Peterson, Urda
Nays: None

A motion was made by Commissioner Doyle and seconded by Commissioner Jacks to approve the demolition of the single family home at 26 N. Sleight.

Aye: Doyle, Vice Chair Jacks, Noel, Ory
Nays: Garrison, Urda, Chairman Peterson, Eveslage

This vote results in a tie. Staff clarified the tie vote results in no recommendation and the applicant has the opportunity to appeal the request to the City Council.

A motion was made by Commissioner Doyle and seconded by Commissioner Urda to table the vote on the single family home.

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Noel, Ory, Eveslage, Chairman Peterson, Urda
Nays: None

F. REPORTS

1. Approve the minutes of the January 24, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

A motion was made by Commissioner Urda and seconded by Commissioner Doyle to approve the minutes of the January 24, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Aye: Doyle, Garrison, Vice Chair Jacks, Noel, Ory, Eveslage, Chairman Peterson, Urda
Nays: None

G. NEW BUSINESS:

H. ADJOURNMENT:

9:08 p.m.